

**Minutes of the  
North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board  
State Board Rm. 755  
November 5, 2018  
9:00 am**

Attendance/NCCSAB	Alan Hawkes Joseph Maimone Phyllis Gibbs Sherry Reeves Cheryl Turner Lindalyn Kakadelis	Alex Quigley Tammi Sutton – <i>Arrived at 12:14p.m.</i> Steven Walker Heather Vuncannon Lynn Kroeger
Attendance/SBE/DPI	<i>Office of Charter Schools</i>  Dave Machado, Director Patricia Nnadi-Purvis, Program Assistant Ashley Baquero, Consultant Danielle Allen, Consultant Shaunda Cooper, Consultant Jay Whalen, Consultant	<i>SBE</i>  <i>Attorney General</i> Tiffany Lucas Stephanie Lloyd  <i>SBE Attorney</i> Eric Snider

**CALL TO ORDER**

- The North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board (CSAB) meeting was called to order at 9:00 am by Vice Chair Mr. Steven Walker who read the Ethics Statement and CSAB Mission Statement. Mr. Walker led the Pledge of Allegiance.
- Mr. Joseph Maimone, as the Superintendent’s designee, stated he will be participating in discussion and evaluation, but will abstain from voting.

**Motion: Motion to approve the October meeting minutes**

**Motion: Heather Vuncannon**

**Second: Cheryl Turner**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

**CLARIFICATION INTERVIEWS**

- Mr. Steven Walker reminded the CSAB that clarification interviews are not full interviews. They are to clarify any questions needed to determine if the applicant receives a full interview.
- Dr. Danielle Allen, OCS Consultant, presented an application update to the CSAB. She stated the December interviews are contingent on the CSAB decisions made today. Dr. Allen gave a brief overview of the application timeline. She explained today's process. Dr. Allen will provide a brief introduction, the applicant will give a statement, committee discussion and questions will take place, a committee deliberation and vote will take place, and the committee will make a recommendation to the full CSAB regarding moving application to a full interview.
- Dr. Allen stated seven schools were originally scheduled and one school withdrew from consideration. There are now six applicant groups appearing today for clarification interviews. Each of these schools has submitted a special request of either acceleration or conversion. She stated five of the six applicants are repeat applicants.
- Dr. Allen proposed December clarification interviews to the CSAB. Each of the applicants have requested acceleration.

#### Clara Science Academy

- Dr. Allen stated the school is proposed to locate in Mecklenburg County. Dr. Allen gave a brief introduction of the school's proposed enrollment and grade levels. There was no LEA impact statement or due diligence for this applicant. Dr. Allen reviewed the pass/fail ratings for this applicant. She stated the applicant is requesting acceleration and is a repeat applicant from last year that received a full interview. She stated the applicant received assistance from Leaders Building Leaders and the NC Public Charter School Accelerator Program and no direct fees were provided to either entity.
- Omar Muhammed introduced himself as the Board Chair. Ms. Varsty Muhammed introduced the school as bringing a STEM program to the Charlotte area. She stated they hope to bring a rigorous program that would prepare students for college. She stated they hope to introduce a diverse way of teaching.
- Mr. Walker asked the committee about questions for clarification for this applicant. Mr. Walker asked what improvements have been made to the application this year. Ms. Heather Vuncannon asked for clarification regarding the STEM program. Ms. Cheryl Turner asked for clarification on the dual language program. Ms. Lynn Kroeger would like clarification on the facility. Mr. Walker would like clarification on the facility because the application doesn't have matching information in the acceleration and other facility section. Ms. Turner would like clarification regarding the lunch program. Mr. Walker stated he was concerned about the employee health care and transportation costs in the finance section.

- Mr. Walker and Ms. Turner emphasized how important it is that the breakeven budget is correct and reflects the minimum number of students needed to be financially viable.
- Mr. Walker asked the applicants what changes they've made to the application this year. Ms. Muhammed stated they looked at how to improve the school's Board of Directors and what they really wanted to offer to the students in terms of the STEM curriculum. Ms. Muhammed continued to explain that they considered the diversity of the proposed school demographics. Mr. Walker asked if the budget changed at all. Mr. Muhammed stated they raised 20k for their buses and last year they didn't have that money. He continued to explain that is why you see monies in the budget for gas and maintenance. Mr. Muhammed continued that Charter Schools Capital has the intent to loan them 275k in the first year. Mr. Walker asked if the buses have been purchased. Mr. Muhammed stated no and that it is listed in the "other funds" section of the budget. Mr. Walker and Ms. Turner stated there is no expense for the buses in the budget. Ms. Kroeger asked if they know the terms of the possible loan at this point. Mr. Muhammed stated no.
- Ms. Vuncannon asked whether they are purchasing a STEM program. Ms. Muhammed stated they are looking at STAR curriculum to evaluate language arts, math, and science. Ms. Vuncannon asked if that is an assessment program. Ms. Muhammed stated yes and that they have looked at several STEM programs, but have not finalized a decision. Ms. Turner asked about the term "informal STEM" as used in the application. Ms. Muhammed stated they will have a variety of techniques including collaboration and hands-on approach to learning. Ms. Muhammed stated they are trying to get away from teacher-led style and students will not be confined to a desk.
- Mr. Walker asked for clarification on dual language. Ms. Muhammed stated one language must be taught and they want to survey the parents and determine what language they want taught. Mr. Walker asked if the teachers will speak in two languages. A representative for the school stated it would not be an immersion program, but more cultural based because they are K-2 students.
- Mr. Walker asked for clarification about the facility. Mr. Muhammed stated last year they had a facility but Head Start beat them to it. They found a new facility with a church with two buildings and a cafeteria. The whole area is about 235,000 square feet. Ms. Turner asked if they could stay there until they have a permanent facility. Mr. Muhammed stated yes. Ms. Kroeger asked about current status. Mr. Muhammed stated they are currently in negotiations with legal teams. The owners have verbally stated they have the facility.
- Mr. Walker stated this is really on the line as to whether this qualifies for acceleration. Ms. Turner stated it's also important to know the rent costs with a tight budget.
- Ms. Turner stated she needs to understand the lunch program. Mr. Muhammed stated they did their research last year and contacted the USDA and was told they need three bids to even get in the program. Mr. Muhammed stated they will provide lunch if the child doesn't bring lunch. Ms. Muhammed stated they want to give parents choices and they will provide breakfast and lunch if needed, but the parent has a choice to provide lunch if wanted.

**Motion: Committee motion to allow an interview for Clara Science Academy**

**Motion: Heather Vuncannon**

**Second: Steven Walker**

**Vote: Unanimous Committee Vote**

**Passed**

**Failed**

- Mr. Hawkes stated he is not sure this is acceleration due to the facility issue. Mr. Hawkes asked for clarification regarding the organizational chart. Ms. Muhammed explained that the board committees are made up of board members that advise in specific areas of expertise, such as curriculum or legal/governance. Ms. Turner asked how many people on the board. Ms. Muhammed stated eight.

**Motion: Full CSAB motion to allow an interview for Clara Science Academy**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Heather Vuncannon**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

- Ms. Turner stated she's not convinced it qualifies for acceleration either, but they have a month before full interviews to get more information regarding the facility.

#### Wilmington School of the Arts

- Dr. Allen stated the school is proposed to locate in New Hanover County. Dr. Allen gave a brief introduction of the school's proposed enrollment and grade levels. There was no LEA impact statement or due diligence for this applicant. They are a repeat applicant that did not receive a full interview last year. This applicant did not receive third party assistance.
- Mr. Barry Rice introduced himself as the Board Chair. Fellow members of the Board, Ms. Elizabeth Niegley, Ms. Emily Orr, Mr. Tom Martin, and Mr. John Westburg introduced themselves.
- Ms. Niegley stated New Hanover County is in desperate need of a high-quality school of choice. She stated the current schools of choice are low-performing and the one that is successful does not provide lunch or transportation to reach all students. She stated this would be an arts-integrated school and stated the school has chosen Wits and Wisdom and Zearn for curriculum. She stated this curriculum is very different from what is currently available in New Hanover schools. She continued to explain the arts integration which will allow students to take arts courses as core curriculum, not electives.
- Mr. Quigley asked if they have changed the application from last year. Ms. Niegley stated they clarified their vision, revised curriculum, and will use a weighted lottery.

- Mr. Rice spoke about the facility – he explained they have a five-year lease and letter of intents for modification of the facility. He stated they also have a letter of intent to help find a permanent facility. Ms. Reeves asked about when they would move to a permanent facility because it was unclear in the application. Ms. Reeves asked if the five-year lease is breakable. Mr. Rice stated yes. Ms. Reeves asked if the facility is prepared. Mr. Rice stated yes – they will need internet connectivity and some room modifications. Ms. Reeves asked if the facility is being used now. Mr. Rice stated no, but it was previously used as a private school.
- Mr. Maimone asked about the location of the facility because they are only about one mile from another charter school. He asked how confident they are that they can get the projected enrollment. Mr. Rice stated there is a lot more parent and community involvement. Mr. Rice stated they feel confident they can make it.
- Mr. Quigley asked for clarification on the organizational chart. Mr. Quigley asked who the principal would be. The board replied Mr. Westburg.
- Ms. Reeves stated the application is much better than last year, but she needs clarity on the weighted lottery. Ms. Reeves stated that the application states that 50% of the seats will be reserved for free/reduced lunch students. Ms. Neigley stated the families would have the option of filling out a form that certifies income per household. She continued that parents would receive this information when they receive their application materials.
- Ms. Phyllis Gibbs asked why they chose to start a third charter school in the same area. Mr. Quigley stated that is a full interview question.

**Motion: Committee motion to allow an interview for Wilmington School of the Arts**

**Motion: Sherry Reeves**

**Second: Lindalyn Kakadelis**

**Vote: Unanimous Committee Vote**

**Passed**

**Failed**

**Motion: Full CSAB motion to allow an interview for Wilmington School of the Arts**

**Motion: Alex Quigley**

**Second: Sherry Reeves**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

MINA Charter School of Lee County

- Dr. Allen stated the school is proposed to locate in Lee County. Dr. Allen gave a brief introduction of the school's proposed enrollment and grade levels. There was no LEA impact statement or due diligence for this applicant. They are a repeat applicant that received a full interview last year. She explained the pass/fail ratings. They did not receive assistance from a third party.

- Dr. Shawn Williams introduced himself as Board President and Ms. Jeannette Peace introduced herself as a member of the board. She stated they will focus their curriculum on a STREAM philosophy. She continued they will have two-year grade looping. She stated that studies demonstrate looping helps with student achievement.
- Ms. Peace stated that there was concern last year about the number of educators on the board and this year they have added educators to the board. She stated they have hired an administrator with 38 years of experience. She stated they also have a facility which is an old Lowes building in Sanford and have included a Letter of Intent with the application. Ms. Peace stated the educational plan is unique in that they have fine-tuned the plan and the budget from last year. She stated there was some concerns last year regarding teacher pay and student numbers. She stated they have decreased student enrollment numbers.
- Mr. Quigley asked if there was anything different from last year's application that hasn't already been mentioned. Dr. Williams stated there is now dual-language and students will get Spanish each day. He continued that they have an administrator and a marketing team. He stated they already have about one hundred student intent forms.
- Ms. Reeves asked for clarification regarding the facility. Ms. Peace stated they would lease the building from MINA's Place. Ms. Turner asked for more information. Ms. Peace stated that MINA's Place is a community non-profit and there is no connection to the school other than providing the building.
- Ms. Peace stated she understood that they couldn't pay a mortgage with state funds. Ms. Turner stated you can use those funds to pay a mortgage. Mr. Walker and Ms. Turner provided clarity to the applicant regarding state funds and facility costs.
- Mr. Walker asked for clarity regarding assessments. Dr. Williams explained the assessment program for the school, including weekly and quarterly assessments.
- Ms. Vuncannon asked for clarity about the academic program priorities. Ms. Peace stated that STREAM would be the number one priority for classroom teachers. The technology and dual language will be supplemental. Ms. Peace clarified that the dual language is not immersion. Ms. Vuncannon asked for more information regarding professional development for teachers. Dr. Williams stated teachers will receive professional development to make STREAM successful, including online and on-site development.
- The CSAB discussed the importance of evaluating whether applicants should be placed in acceleration based on the requirements and in light of so many schools that eventually delay opening.
- Mr. Hawkes stated the organizational chart was really concerning. He stated the Parent-Student Organization is higher on the chart than the Lead Administrator. He stated that poses many problems. He stated you need a clear line of authority and responsibility. Mr. Quigley agreed. Mr. Walker stated the organizational chart is confusing.

**Motion: Committee motion to allow an interview for MINA Charter School of Lee County**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Heather Vuncannon**

**Vote: Unanimous Committee Vote**

**Passed**

**Failed**

**Motion: Full CSAB motion to allow an interview for MINA Charter School of Lee County**

**Motion: Alex Quigley**

**Second: Steven Walker**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

CFA Community Public Charter

- Dr. Allen gave a brief introduction of the school's proposed enrollment and grade levels. The proposed county is Gaston County. There was no LEA impact statement or due diligence for this applicant. She explained the pass/fail ratings. This is a first time applicant requesting acceleration. The applicant received assistance from Leaders Building Leaders and Team CFA. No direct fees were received by either entity.
- Mr. Eddie McGinnis introduced himself as Board Chair. The members of the board introduced themselves. Ms. Sherry Reynolds introduced herself as Head of School. Mr. McGinnis introduced the school, the Head of School, and board members. Mr. McGinnis stated he is a retired principal. He explained the qualifications of the board.
- Mr. Quigley asked about the lease agreement. Mr. McGinnis explained he is the pastor of the church and the Board Chair. Mr. Quigley asked legal if there is any issue with the church leasing the facility to the school under these terms. Mr. Quigley asked if he had any comment on this issue. Mr. McGinnis stated he would recuse himself if there was any discussion about the church and the school. Mr. Quigley stated they would discuss this with legal and advise the Board to also discuss with their own legal counsel.
- Ms. Reeves asked for clarification about the number of board members. Mr. McGinnis stated the planning board members are all willing to step in as board members if needed to increase the number from five.
- Ms. Reeves stated she didn't see a specific target population in the application. Ms. Reeves asked for the compelling need for acceleration. Mr. McGinnis stated that the area is rural and economically low-income. He stated the interest area has already brought in 240 interest surveys. He stated this particular curriculum has been proven successful in the region through Piedmont Community Charter. He stated parents want choice and the other schools all have waiting lists.
- Ms. Reeves asked about how to get the older students, 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> graders, up to speed with the Core Curriculum which spirals year after year. Ms. Reynolds stated that they will use the

resources and support through Team CFA they will be able to help those students acclimate. She stated that they have made an agreement with Thomas Jefferson Classical Academy to bring teachers into that school to observe and get a good understanding of the curriculum.

- Mr. Quigley stopped questioning so it is focused specifically on clarification. Mr. Quigley reminded the CSAB that the decision in front of the CSAB is whether there are any more clarification questions needed to determine whether the school receives a full interview. He continued that the final decision regarding acceleration will be made in the full interview.
- Mr. Maimone asked Ms. Reynolds why she thinks this school is ready for acceleration. Ms. Reynolds stated they are ready to go and just waiting on the approval. She stated they have all the needed components to get started. She also stated that many parents are interested in getting their elementary aged kids in the same school. She continued that Team CFA is ready to provide resources and there has been a lot of background work already done.
- Ms. Lindalyn Kakadelis stated she wants some more clarity on the target population. Mr. Quigley stated that question can wait for full interview.

**Motion: Committee motion to allow an interview for CFA Community Public Charter**

**Motion: Lindalyn Kakadelis**

**Second: Sherry Reeves**

**Vote: Unanimous Committee Vote**

Passed      Failed

**Motion: Full CSAB motion to allow an interview for CFA Community Public Charter**

**Motion: Alex Quigley**

**Second: Sherry Reeves**

**Vote: Unanimous**

Passed                      Failed

Hobgood Charter Academy

- Dr. Allen gave a brief introduction of the school's proposed enrollment and grade levels. The proposed county is Halifax County. There was no LEA impact statement or due diligence for this applicant. She explained the pass/fail ratings. This applicant is requesting acceleration. This is a repeat application and received a full interview last year. The applicant received assistance from Gregg Sinderson. No fees were received by Mr. Sinderson.
- The Board introduced themselves. Ms. Julianne Harris introduced herself as the Board Chair. She explained the Board has heard their words and ready to put their plan into action. They have implemented a weighted lottery. Currently Hobgood Academy is a private school. She explained that many families have expressed interest in the school, but many face financial difficulty in doing so. She stated that nearly half of the K-8 students receive financial assistance to attend the school She explained they want to provide an alternative for families in the area.

- Mr. Joe McDowell stated he has seen the impact of low-performing schools in the area. He stated there is a great need for this charter school in the area. He explained how he became involved in the board and what the school hopes to bring the community.
- Mr. Walker stated the application was much better this year. He stated the financial situation looks better, but the facility transaction may need clarification. Ms. Turner asked about the trust that bought the facility. A representative from the board stated the trust is managed by a local philanthropist and has no official ties to the school in terms of employment or board involvement.
- Mr. Walker asked if they have sold the building and now will lease the building from the trust. The board representative stated that is correct.
- Ms. Turner asked what happens to the 9-12<sup>th</sup> students currently enrolled at the private school because the charter school will be K-8. Ms. Turner stated she needs clarity on the four background checks that stated there was something on the record but provided no details. Mr. Walker stated we need legislative changes to make the background checks more reliable.
- A board representative stated the private school will still be operating as a high school, grades 9-12<sup>th</sup>. They will be on the same campus. They are called Hobgood Academy.

**Motion: Committee motion to allow an interview for Hobgood Charter Academy**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Heather Vuncannon**

**Vote: Unanimous Committee Vote**

**Passed**                       **Failed**

**Motion: Full CSAB motion to allow an interview for Hobgood Charter Academy**

**Motion: Alex Quigley**

**Second: Heather Vuncannon**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**                       **Failed**

Revolution Academy

- Dr. Allen gave a brief introduction of the school's proposed enrollment and grade levels. The proposed county is Guilford County. There was no LEA impact statement or due diligence for this applicant. She explained the pass/fail ratings. This is a repeat application and received a full interview last year. The applicant did not receive assistance from any third party.
- Members of the board introduced themselves. A representative stated they reduced the ADM, changed the education plan including strengthening core knowledge and classical explanations, become more specific regarding the target population, and revised the budget including increasing the budget for transportation and nutrition. She explained they added the multi-tiered support explanation and added team members including a full-time tutor and

more specials teachers. She explained why they want acceleration including parent engagement and a signed lease for a facility that requires no upfit.

- Ms. Turner asked for clarity about the ADM. She has concerns about almost doubling the ADM in year two and being in a temporary facility. The board representative stated part of their strategy for marketing and enrollment is to identify the permanent facility as soon as possible so they can have it built out in the second year and be able to increase the enrollment that second year. She explained they have a back-up plan to look just outside the city limits or stay at the temporary location.
- Ms. Vuncannon asked about the target population. The board representative explained that Greensboro is not close to meeting the market for high-quality charter schools. Ms. Vuncannon asked about the lack of diversity mentioned in the application. The board representative stated they are marketing and targeting the area in such a way to get balance in the school.
- Ms. Kroeger stated her biggest concern is the doubling of enrollment in year two. Ms. Turner stated that is a concern for her too.

**Motion: Committee motion to allow an interview for Revolution Academy**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Heather Vuncannon**

**Vote: Unanimous Committee Vote**

**Passed**

**Failed**

**Motion: Full CSAB motion to allow an interview for Revolution Academy**

**Motion: Alex Quigley**

**Second: Steven Walker**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

### **NOVEMBER STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION UPDATES**

- Mr. Dave Machado discussed the schedule for bringing applicant recommendations to the State Board of Education (SBE).
- Mr. Machado stated that the SBE approved the recommendation to terminate Global Achiever's charter. He explained they approved Bonnie Cone's recommendation to partner with the CMO Team CFA.
- Mr. Machado discussed the October Leadership Institute and believes it was a successful event.

- Mr. Machado explained that the Office of Charter Schools will begin providing the CSAB with data from compliance team meetings. Ms. Ashley Baquero and Ms. Shaunda Cooper, OCS consultants, provided further clarity regarding those reports.

**Motion: Motion to enter closed session for attorney consultation regarding privileged attorney client matters**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Cheryl Turner**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

**Returned to Open Session 1:00 p.m.**

### **2019 RENEWAL SCHOOLS FINANCIAL DATA PRESENTATION**

- Ms. Alexis Schauss introduced the financial review of 2019 renewal charter schools. She explained how the Financial Business Services (FBS) conducts a financial health assessment. Ms. Schauss explained that in addition to reviewing financial statements, they look at student accounting including the number of students they have and the number of students withdrawing. Ms. Schauss stated they also look at material weaknesses or financial concerns outlined in the audits. She explained that they look at any failures to report. She explained that when a school is significantly late the school is put on a minimum 30-day cautionary noncompliance status.
- Ms. Schauss explained the first category: those schools that have received three years of audits and present no financial concerns at this time. Those schools are:
  - 11A Evergreen Community Charter School
  - 11C Invest Collegiate Imagine
  - 11D The Franklin School of Innovation
  - 13C A.C.E. Academy
  - 26C The Capitol Encore Academy
  - 32Q Reaching All Minds Academy
  - 43C Anderson Creek Academy
  - 45A The Mountain Community
  - 60S Bradford Preparatory School
  - 61K United Community School
  - 81A Thomas Jefferson Classical
  - 91A Vance Charter School
  - 92V Wake Forest Charter Academy
  - 92W Cardinal Charter Academy
  - 92Y Envision Science Academy
  - 96C Dillard Academy Charter School
  - 98B Wilson Preparatory Academy

- Ms. Schauss explained that the next group are those schools for which the 2018 LGC audit has not been received, but based on the 2015, 2016, and 2017 audits no financial concerns are present. Review of the 2018 audit could change this assessment. Those schools are:
  - 10B South Brunswick Charter School
  - 49B American Renaissance School
  - 92K Raleigh Charter High School
  - 92N Quest Academy
  - 92Q Hope Charter Leadership Academy
  - 93A Haliwa-Saponi Tribal School
  
- The next group are those schools that have EMOs or CMOs and when we are looking at these financial statements, there is nothing to look at because they have agreements with the EMO or CMO where the EMO or CMO takes the majority of the assets to run the school. So, Ms. Schauss explained, if something were to happen to these organizations the schools would be at risk. Those schools are:
  - 32H Research Triangle Charter Academy
  - 34F Forsyth Academy
  - 41B Greensboro Academy
  - 60U Commonwealth High School
  - 61L Stewart Creek High School
  
- Mr. Hawkes asked where you get the financials for the EMO/CMO. Ms. Schauss stated that would be the auditor's job. Ms. Turner stated that when a school partners with an EMO/CMO, we request financial statements. She asked whether we ask for those financials after that point. Mr. Machado stated no.
  
- Ms. Schauss stated the next category of schools are those with current or previous financial noncompliance issues.
  
- Ms. Schauss reviewed the first school under this category: 32C Carter Community Charter School. She stated there are signs of financial weakness in fiscal years 2017 and 2018. She stated there has been a weakening of the school's financial health. They have been elevated the school from a cautionary to a probationary status.
  
- Ms. Turner asked what a governmental fund balance is. Ms. Schauss stated the fund balance for the board to allocate. Ms. Kroeger asked when talking about the deficit, is it the modified accrual statement? Ms. Schauss stated yes.
  
- Ms. Schauss stated there is an awareness on the part of the school and board to get the school back in good standing. They have a capital campaign planned with a target of 250k and the Executive Director has forfeited the salary for the year.
  
- Ms. Schauss stated that two schools had a negative fund balance and this is an automatic cautionary noncompliance. She stated they will be taken off noncompliance because the

deficits have been resolved. Those schools are 41B Greensboro Academy and 32H Research Triangle Charter Academy.

- Ms. Schauss stated the next two schools are 60U Commonwealth High and 61L Stewart Creek High. They both have very high withdrawal rates, but they are not in any noncompliance status. Ms. Tammi Sutton asked if perhaps they are going to another school because they are doing better. Ms. Schauss stated she does not know the reasons for these withdrawal rates.
- Ms. Schauss moved onto 61J Lakeside Charter Academy (formerly Thunderbird Preparatory) and stated they have had financial compliance concerns from the conception. She stated that ADM has declined significantly (81% over the last three years) and that has affected their financials. The school also had a significant amount of failures to report. They continue to show signs of financial insolvency. She continued to explain the school also showed the failure to make over 500k in lease payments for 2017.
- Ms. Schauss moved onto 42A KIPP Halifax which is on the list for prior financial noncompliance due to failure to report. The school is not currently on financial noncompliance.
- Ms. Schauss explained 60V Charlotte Learning Academy has not submitted the 2018 audit, but they have not had any financial concerns since 2015.
- Ms. Schauss explained 60Y Pioneer Springs Academy has a low fund balance and low cash balance, but there is no specific financial noncompliance.
- Ms. Schauss explained that they have not received the 96F Wayne Preparatory Academy 2018 audit. She stated the school has a prior history of financial noncompliance from 2015, but since then there have been no other issues.
- Ms. Schauss stated the lowest level of noncompliance is cautionary, next is probationary, and the third, or highest, is disciplinary.
- Ms. Turner asked about the definition for financial insolvency. Ms. Schauss stated that if there is a going concern, cash flow issues, etc. She explained that there is no hard and fast definition but is based on the severity of concerns.

## **2019 RENEWAL SCHOOLS PRESENTATIONS**

### **Carter Community Charter School**

- LaManda Pryor, Principal, introduced the school's presentation and her background. Ms. Pryor explained the school's improvement goals and how the school has implemented the multi-tiered support system. She explained the professional development and curriculum training the school has undertaken. She stated pacing guides have been created and a school

improvement team has been created. She continued by explaining there is now a vice principal.

- Ms. Pryor continued by explaining community partnerships in which the school is engaged. She stated the school has met or exceeded growth over the past 5 years. She stated the school believes college prep begins in kindergarten.
- Mr. Walker stated he is concerned with the difference between the school's proficiency and the LEA's proficiency. He wonders when the growth will start translating to higher proficiency. Ms. Pryor stated that is her priority. She is working to support those students that come in behind grade level.
- Mr. Walker asked how much money is in the school's account. The Managing Director stated that in 2015 they bought a building and had to do a lot of work to make it compliant with Durham. They also had to buy buses to serve the entire county. That is a big reason that the cash went down. He stated they have about 125k in the bank. Ms. Kroeger asked for the specific plan to resolve the cash flow issue. The Managing Director stated there is a fundraising campaign planned.

#### Forsyth Academy

- Ms. Wendy Barajas, Principal, introduced the school and conducted an overview of the school's academic data. Ms. Barajas stated that the school continues to make academic growth. She stated there are three improvement priorities: enriched standards-based instruction, focus on data-driven instruction, and enhanced intervention. She explained how the school works to implement these three priorities.
- Ms. Barajas introduced Ms. Beth Robbins with the Board of Directors. Ms. Robbins explained the school is compliant and financially sound.
- Ms. Reeves asked how many students are enrolled in the school. Ms. Barajas stated 678 K-8<sup>th</sup> graders. Mr. Quigley asked if they are at their max size. Ms. Barajas stated they would like to be at 704. Mr. Walker stated that the school doesn't qualify for the ten year renewal, but looks like it would fall into the seven year renewal guidelines.

#### Lakeside Charter Academy

- Dr. Jim Montague, Principal, introduced the school's presentation. He stated the school enrollment is currently at 95 students. He explained the school's current recruitment efforts. He spoke about community events, advertising plans, and increased internet presence for the school. Dr. Montague spoke about the marketing partners they are using to recruit students to the school.
- Dr. Montague continued by explaining the school's curriculum and assessments. He also spoke about professional development for staff and staff retention.

- Mr. Walker stated the big concern is financial stability. Mr. Guthrie, with the Board of Directors, spoke about financials. He stated that enrollment has been the major concern. He stated they are trying to earn back the trust of the community and landlord. He stated the landlord has agreed to continue to lease the building. Mr. Guthrie stated the lease arrangements allow payments to start when they reach 200 students. Ms. Turner asked for the projected ADM. Dr. Montague stated 150. Ms. Turner stated that means there will have to be a reckoning of the cash that was allotted based on that 150 projected ADM. Mr. Walker asked about the audit. Mr. Guthrie stated that the audit should be to the LGC by the end of November. Mr. Walker stated it needs to be in ASAP. Mr. Quigley asked about the total outstanding debt. Mr. Guthrie stated he could get that to Mr. Quigley via email.
- Ms. Reeves asked about how the school does K-8 with 95 students. Dr. Montague stated the middle school had the lowest numbers and 5/6 is a combination class.
- Mr. Quigley asked who does the financials for the school. Mr. Guthrie stated Arcadia NorthStar. Mr. Maimone requested a copy of the revised budget. Ms. Turner requested information regarding how much they will have to repay to the building landlord. Mr. Quigley asked about current cash flow. Mr. Guthrie stated there is about 50k in the bank. Ms. Kroeger asked for the monthly payroll. Mr. Guthrie stated he can provide that. Mr. Maimone asked if they can meet teacher payroll in the next few months. Mr. Guthrie stated yes. Mr. Quigley asked for an updated board list and resumes. Mr. Quigley asked if there is a management company. Mr. Guthrie stated no. Mr. Quigley requested the school leader's resume. Mr. Maimone requested a copy of any fundraising plans.

### Mountain Community School

- Ms. Tonya Blackford, Board President, introduced the school's presentation. A school representative explained the school's philosophy of individualized learning, learning through expeditions, learning through service, and collaborative learning. He also explained the school's key initiatives.
- The EC Coordinator for the school explained the school's data. She explained that a lot of students come into the school below grade level. She explained that in the past two years, they had 28 students transferred out and 45 transferred in. Of the 28 that left, 79% were at or above grade level at exit. Of the 45 that transferred in, 60% were below grade level. She explained that the increase in students entering with an IEP has increased the school's percentage of students with disabilities to 20%.
- The EC Coordinator continued by explaining MAP v. EOG scores. She explained that the school developed an action plan for the problem areas identified by these tests. She showed a graph that demonstrated growth over the last four years and very close to Henderson County. She continued to explain the school's action plan and implemented strategies.
- Mr. Walker stated he believes the school is doing a good job. Mr. Walker states he has no concerns with this school.

### Pioneer Springs Community

- Members of the board introduced themselves. Ms. Becky Friend introduced herself as the Operations and Academic Director at Pioneer Springs. She gave an overview of the school's academic data. She compared the school's data to elementary and middle public schools within a ten-mile radius of Pioneer Springs Community. She stated that in comparison to the elementary schools, they are certainly comparable. She stated we outperform the middle school.
- She continued by explaining the reasons why families chose Pioneer Springs Community. She gave an overview of the school's individualized learning methods. She spoke about the school's nature integration and plans to build a middle school. She explained how the school utilizes a school improvement plan that continually looks three years in the future. She stated that the growing diversity attracts many families and that the school has a high EC population. She described the six pathways that high school students can pursue.
- Mr. Walker asked if the school has tried looking into the data to determine the inconsistency in growth scores. Ms. Friend spoke about how the school has analyzed data to try and improve proficiency scores.

### Reaching All Minds Academy

- Mr. Quigley recused himself from discussion on this matter.
- A representative from the school introduced the school's presentation including enrollment numbers. This year the school is about 300 students in grade K-7. He stated there are two classes per grade level. He stated they are 93% economically disadvantaged. He explained demographic data for the school's students and teachers.
- Another representative for the school explained that class sizes are small and facilities and digital resources are aligned with academic goals. She explained student achievement data and the school's instructional best practices. She stated they have exceeded and met growth but want to increase proficiency. She stated they identified the weakest grade levels and classes on EVAAS and targeted support.
- The school also presented Community Engagement initiatives to the CSAB.
- Mr. Walker asked how involved the Board of Directors is with the school. The Board Chair stated there are nine members and are very involved in the school's policies and procedures. Mr. Walker stated proficiency is the issue and how involved is the Board in crafting the school improvement plan. A representative spoke about comparability with the local LEA. He continued to speak about other initiatives at the school including a student trip to Taiwan and financial/wealth management education.

### Wayne Preparatory

- Sharon Thompson, Chairman of the Board, introduced herself. She spoke about the ribbon cutting ceremony for the new facility. She explained the past history with Thunderbird Prep and the shared vendor with which they worked. She stated there is now no connection with Thunderbird and they have a new lender. She stated there should be a 795k surplus in this year's budget.
- Mr. Hawkes asked for enrollment numbers. She replied about 700. She gave an overview of the board's current members. She explained they meet twice per month and in June of each year they meet for a weekend retreat. She continued by explaining some of the school's offerings such as athletics and the after school program.
- Mr. Twitty, the Managing Director, explained his background and the school's mission statement. He explained the school participates in the Seven Habits of Highly Effective People program. He continued by presenting the school's upcoming goals to the CSAB. He stated the school wants to focus on math improvement, financial security, and data.
- Mr. Twitty gave an overview of academic data and the use of data within the school. Ms. Kakadelis asked how long Mr. Twitty has been the head of school. Mr. Twitty stated two years.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

- **Mr. Quigley made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 3:56 pm. The meeting adjourned via acclamation.**

**Minutes of the  
North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board  
State Board Rm. 755  
November 6, 2018  
9:00 am**

Attendance/NCCSAB	Alan Hawkes Joseph Maimone Phyllis Gibbs Sherry Reeves Cheryl Turner Lindalyn Kakadelis Lynn Kroeger	Alex Quigley Tammi Sutton Steven Walker Heather Vuncannon Kevin Wilkinson - <i>Absent</i>
Attendance/SBE/DPI	<i>Office of Charter Schools</i>  Dave Machado, Director Patricia Nnadi-Purvis, Program Assistant Ashley Baquero, Consultant Danielle Allen, Consultant Shaunda Cooper, Consultant Stephenie Clark, Consultant	<i>SBE</i>  <i>Attorney General</i> Tiffany Lucas Stephanie Lloyd  <i>SBE Attorney</i> Eric Snider

**CALL TO ORDER**

- The North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board (CSAB) meeting was called to order at 9:00 am by Chair Alex Quigley who read the Ethics Statement and CSAB Mission Statement. Mr. Quigley led the Pledge of Allegiance.
- Mr. Joseph Maimone, as the Superintendent’s designee, will be participating in discussion, but will abstain from voting.
- Mr. Alex Quigley has recused himself from discussion on KIPP Durham, any other Durham school matters, and PAVE Southeast Raleigh matters. He will also recuse himself from discussion on his presentation for Healthy Start Academy, where he is Head of School.
- Ms. Sherry Reeves has recused herself from discussion on Ignite Innovation Academy – Pitt.

**SELECTED LOW-PERFORMING SCHOOL PRESENTATIONS**

## KIPP Durham

- Members of the Board of Directors introduced themselves. Ms. Gara Bell, School Leader, introduced herself and her background. She explained the KIPP Durham mission. She outlined the school demographics and reviewed the school's academic data.
- Ms. Bell explained the staff she has supporting the KIPP Durham program. She continued to explain the partnership with the Hill Center and the growth seen through this program. She also discussed the school's partnership with NCCU's School of Social Work.
- Mr. Walker stated the trajectory for growth seems to be going the right way.
- Mr. Hawkes asked about "social justice" in the mission statement. Ms. Bell explained that social justice includes teaching the students about equality for all people and teaching them to be well-rounded individuals.
- Ms. Kakadelis said KIPP has done an unbelievable job in helping students that are historically underserved.

## Rocky Mount Preparatory

- Mr. Todd Pipkin, Head of School, introduced himself and the school's presentation. He stated that the data present doesn't show the complete picture of the transformation happening at Rocky Mount Prep. He explained the complete transformation of the school that has taken place over the last few years.
- Mr. Pipkin spoke about the myriad of changes that have taken place at the school including facility changes, professional development overhaul, high expectations for staff and new teacher pay scale, revised bus routes that saved the school 50k, and redesigning the website. He spoke about the school's 40+ community partnerships. He explained the new partnership with Teach for America and the school's revised professional development.
- Mr. Pipkin continued by speaking about the school's priorities for safety and the increased school safety measures that have been implemented.
- Mr. Pipkin spoke about the school's reformed Powerschool process in order to track enrollment and budget effectively. He stated that during his first year at the school there was no effective system.
- Mr. Quigley asked what the biggest challenge the school is facing. Mr. Pipkin said it is teacher capacity and high expectations for staff.
- Mr. Hawkes asked about enrollment numbers. Mr. Pipkin stated about 1264. Mr. Hawkes asked if the proficiency score will be improving. Mr. Pipkin stated he believes it will.

- Dr. Chaunté Garrett, Chief Academic Officer, presented the school's academic improvement plan.
- Ms. Turner stated she is concerned that there are so many areas of focus in the academic plan. She worries this is too much for teachers, especially new teachers, to be able to do effectively.
- Mr. Quigley asked what the school believes is going well. Dr. Garrett stated she believes the modeling and coaching is going well. She stated teacher turnover makes it even harder. Ms. Sutton asked what accounts for the teacher turnover. Dr. Garrett stated that leadership has changed and there has been inconsistency and that brought frustration. Mr. Pipkin stated that they have high expectations for staff and they looked at how they are hiring to find the right people. He stated they had to make some hard choices to make sure they have the right people in place. Ms. Reeves asked about the experience level of new staff. Dr. Garrett stated it is a mixture of experienced and novice. Dr. Garrett stated they try to be upfront in the hiring process about teacher expectations.
- Ms. Reeves asked about student attrition rate. Dr. Garrett stated she doesn't have the exact numbers, but the majority of students stay.

#### Wilmington Preparatory Academy

- Mr. Kevin Johnson, School Principal, introduced himself and members of the Board of Directors. Mr. Johnson stated he has been the Principal since 2010.
- Mr. Johnson reviewed the 2017 academic data. He continued to present the 2018-19 school goals. He reviewed the 2018-19 strategic plan which included an academic goal, professional development goal, and governance goal.
- Mr. Johnson discussed the action steps that the school plans to take to meet its goals.
- Mr. Hawkes asked about current enrollment. Mr. Johnson stated 140. Mr. Hawkes asked if the 24-point difference between the New Hanover LEA will narrow this year. Mr. Johnson stated yes, that is why they have this plan.
- Ms. Reeves asked how many students were tested last year. Mr. Johnson stated approximately 80.
- Mr. Quigley asked to review the data again. Mr. Quigley stated the data is fascinating because the fourth grade scores are so high and third grade scores so low. Mr. Quigley wondered why the sixth grade scores dropped so much. Mr. Quigley asked if they got a bunch of new students in sixth grade. Mr. Johnson stated no, maybe 50%. Mr. Quigley stated that with such a small school, you may want to look at the numbers rather than the percentages. Mr. Quigley asked what their ideal size is for total enrollment. Mr. Johnson stated 165.

- Ms. Reeves asked how long they were out for the hurricane. Mr. Johnson stated three weeks, but it was at the same time as the planned intercession.
- A representative from the Board stated that the mission of the school sets them up for challenges because they seek to reach urban, economically disadvantaged students.
- Mr. Maimone stated that as charter schools we are supposed to be innovative, so we can reach those students. Mr. Maimone stated yes, you have a big task, but that is your job as a charter school. Mr. Quigley stated that kids of all income levels and races can succeed. Ms. Turner stated at some point you must close the gap to proficiency or you haven't accomplished anything. Mr. Quigley stated that if you sign up for the work, you must be willing to make the growth.

### Ignite Innovation Academy – Pitt

- Mr. Tom McCarthy, Principal, introduced himself and the school. Mr. McCarthy stated that he has been with the school since the doors opened, but in several different capacities. He believes there has been a lack of stability at all levels of the school and a lack of fidelity in operations.
- He explained the areas that were identified as immediate goals: accountability, data analysis, communication, MTSS process, and school culture. He explained the school did not open the first year and therefore have only had two years of operating before going into the renewal cycle.
- Mr. Walker asked about this year's enrollment. Mr. McCarthy stated 205. Mr. Quigley asked what other roles he has served in for the school. Mr. McCarthy stated at first he was in a consulting position, then moved into a finance and facility capacity. He continued that after that, he was approached to be the Principal. He took over in March of last year.
- Mr. Quigley stated it is very concerning that out of the gate, the school has not made academic growth.
- Mr. McCarthy spoke about the consulting group they are working with – KM Group. Mr. Quigley asked for more details regarding their consulting. Mr. McCarthy stated it is financial and academic consulting. Mr. Quigley stated it is hard to outsource academic improvement. Mr. McCarthy has stated he understands that and that it is not being completely outsourced. He stated that parents have made so many comments about the improved feeling at the school. He continued that they are spending a lot of time on character traits at the school.
- Ms. Turner asked about how many teachers you have per grade level. Mr. McCarthy stated they have about 21 students per teacher and one teacher per grade level. He stated the middle school operates on a rotation schedule.
- Mr. Maimone stated we need to see improvement this year because otherwise it will be very difficult to renew next year. Mr. Walker stated he doesn't even know if growth this year will

do it because the data is so bad. Mr. Maimone replied that we need to give them one more year to see that growth because they've only had two years to operate and had a lot of turmoil in those years.

- Ms. Kakadelis asked if anyone from the Board was here today. Mr. McCarthy stated no, they were not able to make it work today. Ms. Kakadelis asked if the Board recognizes that if the school does not improve, they should relinquish the charter. Mr. McCarthy replied that the Board understands the severity of the situation. Mr. McCarthy stated yes. Mr. Quigley stated it is unacceptable that the Board is not here. Mr. Quigley asked the CSAB how they feel about bringing the Board back to speak with the CSAB. Members of CSAB agreed. Mr. Maimone stated around February or March should be a good time frame.
- Ms. Sutton asked how the budget looks. Mr. McCarthy stated they are about 16k in the bad but found some areas to make adjustments.

#### PreEminent Charter

- The Board Chair introduced herself and introduced the Principal Melanie Butler-Williams.
- Mr. Walker asked if they were going to continue to do what they did last year. Ms. Butler-Williams stated yes. Mr. Quigley asked what they have done to improve. She replied they use data effectively and hold people accountable.
- Ms. Kakadelis asked how long she has been the principal. Ms. Butler-Williams stated seven years.
- Ms. Butler-Williams stated she also has great staff and helping to coach and grow the staff. She stated this last year, turnover has gone down and is a huge drop from when she started. She is ensuring the right people are in the right spot and giving incentives for staying.
- Ms. Kakadelis asked about this year's enrollment. Ms. Butler-Williams stated 675. Mr. Quigley asked about the number in tested grades. She replied, about 400.
- Mr. Quigley stated he hopes NHA uses Ms. Butler-Williams' expertise to help schools understand what can be done.

#### PAVE Southeast Raleigh Charter

- Mr. Spencer Robertson, CEO and founder of PAVE schools, introduced himself and two additional board members. He also introduced the Executive Director Ms. Mabel Lajes-Guiteras.
- Mr. Robertson described the school's strengths: strong curriculum, engaged and invested parents and families, an engaged board, and a talented and aligned School Leadership Team.

- Mr. Roberston explained the areas in which the school is struggling including implementing and translating a school model/program developed in NY within the NC context. He explained part of that is financing. He stated another challenge was the founding school leader succession plan. He stated that impacted stability within the school. He continued that another challenge is financial sustainability and leveraging the support of a CMO that is 400 miles away.
- Mr. Robertson discussed the school’s EOG data and stated they recognize it is not good enough. He stated the school has plans in place to address this.
- Ms. Lajes-Guiteras explained the school’s three academic priorities: culture, teachers, and students. She stated that a Dean of Culture has been added, as well as an Academic Director. She continued that there have been additional professional development sessions scheduled and increased data meetings.
- Ms. Reeves asked about beginning of grade tests. Ms. Lajes-Guiteras stated that 15% of third graders passed with a 3, 4, or 5 level.

**Motion: Motion to enter closed session for attorney consultation regarding privileged attorney client matters**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Heather Vuncannon**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**                       **Failed**

**Returned to Open Session at Noon**

**THREE RIVERS ACADEMY**

- Ms. Melissa Grimes, Principal, introduced herself. She stated they started the year with several challenges, but they are doing better at meeting the needs of the children.
- Ms. Grimes stated the current enrollment is approximately 90 students. She stated they did the beginning of year third grade test and about 83% of the students scored a 1. She realizes they have their work cut out for them.
- She states that they use the schedule strategically. The students receive core instruction in the mornings and recess in the afternoons.
- Members of the Board of Directors and the Global Education Resources representative, Don McQueen, introduced themselves.
- Mr. Walker stated he understands there have been challenges with this first assumption. He continued that what concerns him now is the funding. He believes they were funded at 202,

so the school has drawn down the state allotment. He wonders how they can continue with financial stability.

- Mr. McQueen states that Global Education Resources invested about 120k to get the school up and running. He stated he expects enrollment to return to its original numbers. He stated there are also some federal grants outstanding. He continued that Global Education Resources realizes they may have to step up and provide additional funding. Mr. Walker asked if the federal grant money doesn't come through or there is a delay in the lunch program funding, is Global Education Resources able to step in to financially sustain the school. Mr. McQueen stated yes.
- Mr. Maimone asked if there is a structured process for documenting loans to schools and is that part of the audit process. Mr. McQueen stated that is not part of the audit process, but we have a strict line of access to funds, including to our own personal resources.
- Mr. Quigley asked Ms. Alexis Schauss from Division of School Business to speak on the matter. She stated she has had concerns about the school from the beginning. She stated it has been somewhat unusual for the habitual late reporting. She stated that financial reporting was late for three reporting months. She also has concerns about the lack of responsiveness regarding the late reporting. She continued that she has concerns about the reliability of the data that is being provided. She stated the monthly financial reports are not making sense. She continued that July and August were late and the school stated that there were no expenditures for those months. She continued that the projected enrollment was 212 and the first allotment was given based on this number. She stated the average monthly membership is 68 students. She stated that there is no additional funding – on November 2, 2018, they pulled down their final funding. She stated she is trying to minimize the risk to the state.
- Mr. McQueen stated that the report of no expenditures of July and August were true because they had no funding. Ms. Grimes stated she had a really hard time getting someone to help her with the PMR. She explained the difficulty she has had in getting someone from DPI to assist with the matter.
- Mr. Walker stated they need to make sure this doesn't become a habit and make sure you get things in on time going forward. He stated the number one concern is making sure you make it through the year.
- Ms. Turner asked Ms. Schauss how much they will seek to pull back. Ms. Schauss stated around 275k.
- Ms. Schauss explained charter schools are funded based on month one. She continued that any adjustments will be made in the third installment.
- Mr. Quigley stated the crucial question is to what extent Global Education Resources is prepared to back the school financially. Mr. McQueen stated they expected challenges, this school presented a few more than expected, but they are projecting forward the monthly expenditures and they are under control to maintain the school for the remainder of the year.

- Mr. Walker asked that Global Education Resources provide the Office of Charter Schools with a statement of what they have spent to get the school up and running, and a statement of what they are willing to invest to keep the school funded. Mr. McQueen stated yes.
- Ms. Vuncannon asked for an update on the debt negotiations with previous vendors. Mr. McQueen stated they were in negotiations with a former vendor for the school trailers, but they could not come to an agreement. He stated any other vendor that has reached out to us, we have tried to come to terms with them. He continued that the transition of records and information was very difficult from the prior school operators.
- Mr. Hawkes expressed concern about Global Education Resources' work with prior vendors and reconciling the debt. Mr. Hawkes stated that it was his understanding Global Education Resources would assume these debts. Mr. McQueen stated he understands this and that they were unaware of the significance of debt and the challenges they would face with the prior operators.
- The attorney for Global Education Resources explained that they have worked in good faith to resolve the debts. He stated the assuming school made the best decisions they could based on what they found when assuming the school. He explained they still have not received the assets belonging to the school.
- Ms. Reeves asked who was responsible for the 2017-18 audits. Mr. Machado stated it should be Heritage. The CSAB posed the question whether there is any legal recourse against the prior school operators. Mr. Hawkes asked if the state is trying to recover the assets. The attorney for Global Education Resources stated there is an ongoing lawsuit regarding the assets. He stated the assuming entity is doing what he believes should have probably occurred earlier and done by the state. He stated Global Education Resources worked with any vendors where an opportunity to work with the vendor existed. He continued if there was no opportunity, new vendors have been found.
- Mr. Quigley suggested that a committee take a look at the recommendations from Global Education Resources regarding the assumption process. Mr. Quigley stated the CSAB needs to consider if assumptions are worth it.

### **HEALTHY START ACADEMY**

- Mr. Alex Quigley, Head of School, introduced himself, the Board Chair Liz Morey, and a guest teacher, Ms. Collins.
- Mr. Quigley stated his first step in coming to Healthy Start in October 2017 was to identify key challenges. He explained the three key challenges as school culture, instructional management, and staff culture. He continued to identify the three key strengths: aligned leadership team and board of directors, fiscal strength, and compliance/facility.

- Mr. Quigley explained the three priority areas: culture of high expectations and urgency, use relevant data to drive instruction, and ensure teachers teach the right content the right way.
- Mr. Quigley continued by discussing the culture of high expectations he worked to implement at Healthy Start Academy. He stated this included systems and routines and addressing the mindset of staff and students. He continued to explain how to overwhelm the problem and silence culture killers. He stated that he believed the school needed to see a model of excellence and so he cancelled school one day and made a whole staff visit to Henderson Collegiate.
- Mr. Quigley spoke about using relevant data to improve academics and teaching the right content, the right way.
- Mr. Quigley discussed the school's 2018-19 priority areas: school culture, data driven instruction, instructional planning and execution, observation and feedback, and staff culture. He closed by speaking about the wins and gaps the school is currently experiencing. The wins are arrive/first five, weekly quizzes, and community circle. The gaps are 3-8 ELA curriculum, student work habits, and weekly data meetings.
- Ms. Collins spoke about the changes she has seen in six years with Healthy Start Academy. She stated that Mr. Quigley is the fourth principal she has worked under at the school. She states that the change has been night and day. She expressed how staff culture has improved drastically. Ms. Collins continued to speak about the minor changes that have been made to make a significant difference. She feels supported in her work.
- Ms. Reeves asked about the curriculum changes. Mr. Quigley stated in the lower grades Reading Mastery is being used and a guided reading program. He is using some of the Uncommon Schools reading and writing programs. He continued that the school is using Zearn for math instruction.
- Ms. Kakadelis asked about staff turnover. Mr. Quigley stated that 41% of the teaching staff is new, but that includes new positions added this year.

### **DR. TAMMY HOWARD**

- Dr. Tammy Howard, Director of NCDPI Accountability, addressed the CSAB regarding the new NC Math Standards.
- Dr. Howard stated that this year's math assessments will be new. She stated that the EOC tests for NC Math I and NC Math III both have forms that have been posted online. She stated the EOG new math assessments are currently being created. She stated that new forms for those classes should be released by the end of January.

- Ms. Turner asked if there could be growth this year between two different assessments. Dr. Howard stated yes due to the EVAAS model. She stated that SAS is aware there is a rollout of new assessments. She discussed how certain teachers will work on a panel with an external vendor to conduct the standard setting. She stated that after that process, they will go to the SBE with recommended achievement levels. Dr. Howard continued to explain how the achievement levels will be set and how student level information will be released, which will not occur until August.
- Mr. Quigley asked if the NC Check-ins are mimicking what we expect the EOG to look like. Dr. Howard stated that the NC Check-ins source and process is very similar to the EOG and EOC. She continued that there has not been a linking study or prediction analysis for the two tests. She continued that anecdotally they are hearing that some people saying they see a correlation, but it's more appropriate to think of the NC Check-ins as providing immediate information that can then be used in the adjustment of instruction.
- Mr. Quigley asked whether there is a retest of mathematics this year. Dr. Howard stated we call it summer program and that no, there will be no summer program for mathematics.
- Ms. Reeves asked for confirmation of the math scores being used for a growth standard. Dr. Howard stated that yes, SAS will go through the statistical analysis to make sure they can continue with the growth data index for the 2018-19 testing, even with new standards.
- Ms. Kakadelis asked if they expect a decline in the proficiency scores this year. She spoke about the major shift to the Career and College Readiness Standards in 2012. She stated that this year, they do not expect such a major shift because it is not a major standard change.
- Mr. Quigley asked if we will continue with the five achievement levels. Dr. Howard stated we are currently having those conversations because we want to approach this in the most efficient manner possible to minimize the time in testing. Mr. Quigley asked if it is a possibility that this year we will go back to the four achievement levels. Dr. Howard explained that she doesn't believe that test scores will necessarily drop due to the new mathematics test. She stated it is not an automatic given that test scores will drop with new assessments. Dr. Howard stated they are looking at the possibilities with the achievement levels, but they are looking at the data to make determinations.
- Ms. Kakadelis asked if the agency ever runs the proposed cut scores to see the numbers before deciding those cut scores. Dr. Howard stated no, to her knowledge that has never been done. Dr. Howard continued to speak about standard setting, which is a process and also a policy.

- Ms. Kakadelis asked what vendors have been used in the past. Dr. Howard stated Pearson has been one and there have been others.
- Dr. Howard spoke about the summer program and implementing the program online.

### **SELECTED LOW-PERFORMING SCHOOL PRESENTATIONS**

#### Aristotle Preparatory Academy

- Members of the Board of Directors introduced themselves, as well as the EC Coordinator, Instructional Coach, Parent Liaison, Dean of Students, and Head of School Charlie French.
- Ms. French spoke about the school's improvement plans. She spoke that when she first arrived at Aristotle Preparatory Academy it was a culture shock. She implemented conscious discipline and school-wide behavior expectations. Ms. French spoke about getting discipline under control before being able to address academics. She reviewed the decrease in suspension data.
- Ms. French discussed academic changes that have been implemented at the school. She explained the Aristotle Beginning of Year data and EOG performance data. She spoke about the changes made to schedules to allow for more time on task and instruction. Ms. French stated there is a thirty-minute remediation period every day and afterschool tutoring is offered as well.
- Ms. Kakadelis stated her concern is the low proficiency scores. Ms. French stated she is concerned as well and thus they've made these changes. Ms. Kakadelis asked if she believes the culture has changed. Ms. French stated yes, but she hasn't done it on her own. The parent liaison spoke about the changes she has seen in the school. She spoke about how the students were out of control and this impacted her son's ability to learn. She stated that when Ms. French came to the school, things began to change and that this year things have been phenomenal. She stated it has been a definite culture change.
- Ms. Reeves asked when the school opened. Ms. French stated 2013.
- Ms. French continued to speak about the changes that have taken place at the school and she believes the school can continue to improve. Ms. Kakadelis stated she likes what she is seeing and is happy to see the board of directors here as well.
- A member of the board of directors spoke about the major cultural shift she has witnessed at the school.

#### UpROAR Leadership Academy

- The Vice Chair of the Board of Directors discussed the school’s five-year plan. He stated he has seen a great change in the culture and climate in the school over the last year.
- The School Leader, Ms. Genesisia Newsome, spoke about the challenge behavior presented in the first year. She stated this year they have focused on reforming the behavior among the students/cadets. She stated they have brought on a crisis specialist and curriculum specialist. She spoke about the remediation and interventions taking place at the school.
- Ms. Reeves asked if last year was the first year of operation. Ms. Newsome stated yes. Ms. Reeves asked what happened last year with these really low scores. Ms. Newsome stated that culture was not where it needed to be and staff buy-in was not there. She stated last year there was a lot of staff turnover. Ms. Newsome stated that this year, staff is working together as a team and there is more parental engagement.
- Mr. Walker asked about enrollment. Ms. Newsome stated 130 students. Ms. Reeves asked if they added 9<sup>th</sup> grade this year. Ms. Newsome stated yes. Ms. Reeves asked what challenges that has presented. Ms. Newsome stated it is mainly surrounding behavior.
- Mr. Quigley asked who is coaching Ms. Newsome. Ms. Newsome stated she is receiving support from Leaders Building Leaders.
- Ms. Kakadelis stated you may want to give us the numbers of proficient at the next presentation because the school’s enrollment is so low.
- Mr. Quigley asked if they are attracting more students that have a track record of behavioral challenges. Ms. Newsome stated yes, that has been the case. Ms. Newsome stated that some parents thought a “military” academy was the same as an “alternative” school. She stated that they are now promoting the school as a leadership academy rather than a military academy.

#### Paul R. Brown Leadership Academy

- Mr. Carl Lloyd introduced himself, staff, and members of the Board of Directors. He stated the school opened in 2013 and serves five counties, grades 6-12. He spoke about the demographics of the student population. The school serves 186 students total. He spoke about the achievements of the school over the past year. He spoke about curriculum, support for students, and new staffing.
- Mr. Lloyd discussed the school’s strategic plan to improve test scores. He spoke about new staff members and partnership with Dr. Bradshaw of Thomas Academy as a consultant to help improve the school’s test scores. Mr. Lloyd discussed increased teacher support and professional development.

- Mr. Lloyd explained the school's 2017-18 goals and the results of those goals. He continued by explaining the 2018-19 school academic goals. Ms. Sutton asked about 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> grade student numbers. He replied there are 23 6<sup>th</sup> graders and 26 7<sup>th</sup> graders.
- The CSAB expressed great concern about the goals for proficiency the school has outlined. Mr. Lloyd stated you have to follow the data and the goals are based on the EVAAS scores. Ms. Turner and Ms. Reeves explained to Mr. Lloyd regarding Math I and Math III exams and accountability. Mr. Walker expressed his frustration with the school's past academic data and current goals. Mr. Lloyd stated he doesn't want to pad numbers; he continued he is talking about proficiency scores, but they want to grow all kids. He stated he believes they are figuring things out in reading.
- Ms. Kakadelis has asked about whether the school is alternative. Mr. Lloyd stated no, but that they take kids that have academic and behavioral issues and work with them more than others have.

**Motion: Motion to enter closed session for attorney consultation regarding privileged attorney client matters**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Lindalyn Kakadelis**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

**Returned to Open Session at 3:20 p.m.**

- Mr. Lloyd stated that he spoke with someone that told him to go to CSAB with low goal numbers because otherwise the CSAB would eat you alive. Mr. Lloyd stated he took bad advice. Mr. Quigley stated we don't want to see unrealistic numbers, but we don't want to see low expectations.
- Mr. Quigley stated the CSAB is considering all options. He stated the school has been operating for five years and is continually low-performing. He stated that the CSAB has requested a report from the Office of Charter Schools regarding the recent site visit. He asked if the Board of Directors would like to speak. Mr. Lloyd stated he didn't mean to insult the CSAB with the goal numbers. Mr. Quigley stated the CSAB is looking at the bigger picture and the data from the previous years. Mr. Quigley stated that Paul R. Brown will be on the agenda next month and the CSAB will await reports from the Office of Charter Schools.
- The Board Chair addressed the CSAB and told the CSAB the students at Paul R. Brown are being taught discipline and morals. She expressed the opinion that not all students are cut out to be doctors or lawyers and not all education comes from a textbook. She stated Paul R.

Brown is reaching the students that will be proficient, but also those that will have ordinary jobs. She stated the school is showing some growth and that is important.

- Mr. Lloyd stated that they are going to fix this and they aren't giving up on those kids. He invited the CSAB to come visit the school and see what they are doing. He stated that the kids want to be there, the parents want to be there. He asked the CSAB to let them finish this year and give them a chance to make growth.
- Mr. Quigley stated that no action is being taken today and they should continue to do the things they are doing to make the school improve. He continued that the Office of Charter Schools will be in touch regarding next steps.
- Mr. Hawkes stated that this school has had opportunity to improve, but if you look at the data from the last five years you see four "F"s and a "D" and a proficiency level below the county, which is below the state.
- Mr. McKoy, the Head of School, addressed the CSAB and stated that the kids they receive are coming from Bladen County and come in behind. He stated they take the kids that have been low-performing and give them the opportunity to be productive citizens.
- Ms. Kakadelis asked if they are a drop-out prevention school. Mr. McKoy stated no.
- Mr. Walker and Mr. Quigley advised the Board of Directors to get together and decide if they would like to make a resolution regarding improvement and relinquishment of the charter if the school does not improve.

### **AMENDMENTS FOR DISCUSSION**

#### Moore Montessori

- Ms. Ashley Baquero, OCS Consultant, presented the amendment request from Moore Montessori Community School to implement a priority lottery for economically disadvantaged students. Ms. Baquero explained the school opened in 2018 in Moore County and hopes to reach a goal of 40% economically disadvantaged students through the implementation of a priority lottery.
- Ms. Baquero explained that priority ("weighted") lotteries are allowed based on statute and are used to help diversify student populations.
- The CSAB discussed the amendment and a motion was made to approve the amendment.

**Motion: Motion to approve the amendment**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Tammi Sutton**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

Metrolina Regional Scholars Academy

- Ms. Ashley Baquero, OCS Consultant, presented the amendment request from Metrolina Regional Scholars Academy to implement a priority lottery for economic diversity. Ms. Baquero explained that the school serves the highly-gifted students and there is an admissions process for student selection.
- Ms. Turner expressed concerns regarding the admissions process and the ability of low-income students to afford testing required for the admissions process. Ms. Baquero responded she would assume the school would help supplement those costs, but she does not know how the school will handle testing for low-income students.
- Ms. Turner also expressed concerns regarding the test used to admit students and whether it under-identifies low-income students of color. She stated she would not be able to vote on the issue at this point.
- Members of CSAB asked for more information regarding low-income students and the admissions testing process before proceeding on the amendment.
- Mr. Quigley asked the Office of Charter Schools to consider how schools are verifying income status.

**CSP GRANT PRESENTATION**

- Mr. Jay Whalen presented the subgrant timeline to the CSAB. He explained that they hope to post the request for applicants in January 2019, with applications due in March 2019. He continued to explain the application timeline.
- Ms. Reeves asked if the application is created. Mr. Whalen stated yes and it must be approved by the US Department of Education. He explained the main components of the application and rubric.

**Motion: Motion to approve the subgrant timeline, application, and rubric for the CSP Grant**

**Motion: Steven Walker**

**Second: Phyllis Gibbs**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

**ADJOURNMENT**

- **Mr. Walker made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 4:08 pm. The meeting adjourned via acclamation.**