United States Department of the Interior  
National Park Service  

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES  
REGISTRATION FORM  

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations for individual properties and districts. See instructions in How to Complete the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form (National Register Bulletin 16A). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box or by entering the information requested. If any item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, architectural classification, materials, and areas of significance, enter only categories and subcategories from the instructions. Place additional entries and narrative items on continuation sheets (NPS Form 10-900a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer, to complete all items.

1. Name of property

historic name  Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery  
other names/site number

2. Location

street & number  800 and 803 Sixteenth Street  
city or town  Greensboro  
state  North Carolina  
code  NC  
county  Guilford  
code  081  
zip code  27405

type for publication  N/A  
vicinity  N/A

3. State/Federal Agency Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1986, as amended, I hereby certify that this decision nomination for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60. In my opinion, the property  meets does not meet the National Register Criteria. I recommend that this property be considered significant nationally  state wide  locally. (See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

Signature of certifying official  Date

North Carolina Department of Cultural Resources  
State or Federal agency and bureau

In my opinion, the property  meets does not meet the National Register criteria. (See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

Signature of certifying official  Date

State or Federal agency and bureau

4. National Park Service Certification

I, hereby certify that this property is:

__ entered in the National Register  
__ See continuation sheet.  
__ determined eligible for the National Register  
__ See continuation sheet.  
__ determined not eligible for the National Register  
__ removed from the National Register  
__ other (explain):  

Signature of the Keeper  Date of Action
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery

Guilford County, North Carolina

5. Classification

Ownership of Property
(Check as many boxes as apply)

- XX private
- ___ public-local
- ___ public-State
- ___ public-Federal

Category of Property
(Check only one box)

- XX building(s)
- ___ district
- ___ site
- ___ structure
- ___ object

Number of Resources within Property
(Do not include previously listed resources in the count)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Contributing</th>
<th>Noncontributing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>buildings</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sites</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>structures</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>objects</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Name of related multiple property listing
(Enter "N/A" if property is not part of a multiple property listing.)

N/A

6. Function or Use

Historic Functions
(Enter categories from instructions)

- Religion/religious facility
- Religion/church-related residence
- Funerary/cemetery

Current Functions
(Enter categories from instructions)

- Religion/religious facility
- Religion/church-related residence
- Social/civic
- Funerary/cemetery

7. Description

Architectural Classification
(Enter categories from instructions)

- Federal
- Colonial Revival

Materials
(Enter categories from instructions)

- foundation ___ stone
- roof ______ asphalt
- walls ______ brick
- ______ wood
- other ______ glass

Narrative Description
(Describe the historic and current condition of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)
8. Statement of Significance

Applicable National Register Criteria
(Mark "x" in one or more boxes for the criteria qualifying the property for National Register listing)

XX A Property is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

XX B Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.

XX C Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.

XX D Property has yielded, or is likely to yield information important in prehistory or history.

Criteria Considerations
(Mark "x" in all the boxes that apply.)

XX A owned by a religious institution or used for religious purposes.

XX B removed from its original location.

XX C a birthplace or a grave.

XX D a cemetery.

XX E a reconstructed building, object, or structure.

XX F a commemorative property.

XX G less than 50 years of age or achieved significance within the past 50 years.

Documentation:
Areas of Significance
(Enter categories from instructions)
Exploration/Settlement
Social History
Education

Period of Significance
1775-1952

Significant Dates
1775
1824
1827

Significant Person
Caldwell, David

Cultural Affiliation
N/A

Architect/Builder
Albright, Jacob, builder
Barton, Harry, architect

Narrative Statement of Significance
(Explain the significance of the property on one or more continuation sheets.)

9. Major Bibliographical References

Bibliography
(Cite the books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form on one or more continuation sheets.)

Previous documentation on file (NPS)
preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested.
previously listed in the National Register
previously determined eligible by the National Register
designated a National Historic Landmark
recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey #
recorded by Historic American Engineering Record #

Primary Location of Additional Data
XX State Historic Preservation Office
Other State agency
Federal agency
Local government
University
Other

Name of repository: North Carolina HPO, Raleigh

10. Geographical Data
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery
Guilford County, North Carolina

Name of Property: Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery

County and State: Guilford County, North Carolina

Acreage of Property: approx. 8 acres

UTM References (Place additional UTM references on a continuation sheet):

- Zone Easting Northing
  - Zone Easting Northing
    - 1 17 609785 3996560
    - 2 __ __ __ __

Verbal Boundary Description
(Describe the boundaries of the property on a continuation sheet.)

Boundary Justification
(Explain why the boundaries were selected on a continuation sheet.)

11. Form Prepared By

name/title: Davyd Foard Hood
organization: __________________ date: February 2002
street & number: Islinglass, 6907 Old Shelby Road telephone: 704-462-1847

12. Additional Documentation
Submit the following items with the completed form:

Continuation Sheets

Maps
A USGS map (7.5 or 15 minute series) indicating the property's location.
A sketch map for historic districts and properties having large acreage or numerous resources.

Photographs
Representative black and white photographs of the property.

Additional items (Check with the SHPO or FPO for any additional items)

Property Owner
(Complete this item at the request of the SHPO or FPO.)

name: Mrs. Dorothy Schoolfield, Clerk of the Session, Buffalo Presbyterian Church
street & number: 803 Sixteenth Street telephone: ________________

Paperwork Reduction Act Statement: This information is being collected for applications to the National Register of Historic Places to nominate properties for listing or determine eligibility for listing, to list properties, and to amend existing listings. Response to this request is required to obtain a benefit in accordance with the National Historic Preservation Act, as amended (16 U.S.C. 470 et seq.).

Estimated Burden Statement: Public reporting burden for this form is estimated to average 18.1 hours per response including the time for reviewing instructions, gathering and maintaining data, and completing and reviewing the form. Direct comments regarding this burden estimate or any aspect of this form to the Chief, Administrative Services Division, National Park Service, P.O. Box 37127, Washington, DC 20013-7127; and the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reductions Project (1024-0018), Washington, DC 20503.
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery

Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, which long predate the founding of Greensboro in 1808, occupy a 5.03-acre tract in the northeast corner of Sixteenth and North Church streets, about two and three-fourths miles north of the crossing of Market and Elm streets, the city’s principal east/west and north/south arteries. The church manse (#3) and its garage (#4), together with an asphalt-paved parking lot, are located on a smaller 1.66-acre tract on the south side of Sixteenth Street, in the southeast corner of the intersection. These two tracts, totaling 6.69 acres, comprise the historic grounds of the church property acquired between 1768 and 1860 (with additions in 1958 from Cone Mills Corporation and in 1958 and 1964 from the White Oak Cemetery, Inc., which holds the Cone Family Cemetery). When the church was built and for the most of the nineteenth century, this area of Greensboro was rural; today, the church grounds are an oasis in this northeast quadrant of the city that is dominated by the great Proximity, Revolution, and White Oak textile mills, villages, and related facilities erected by the Cone family from the late 1890s into the early twentieth century. Caesar Cone School, erected in 1935, stands on the west side of Church Street and immediately southwest of the church grounds while the Cone Family Cemetery, a fenced park comprising the setting of a handsome Classical Revival-style granite mausoleum, forms the east boundary of the church property.

The grounds of Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery reflect the use of the site for religious and worship services and burials from the later decades of the eighteenth century into the mid-twentieth century. The congregation’s first (log) and second (frame) churches stood in what is now the cemetery and were succeeded by the present church completed in 1827.

The grass-covered lawn of Buffalo Presbyterian Church (#1), fronting south onto Sixteenth Street, is shaded by towering white oaks and other deciduous trees; the lawn comprises the front third of the larger tract while the cemetery (#2) occupies the back two-thirds. The church stands at the back of a paved circular drive whose outer edge is planted with boxwood. It and the two educational buildings are planted with evergreen foundation plantings. The church lawn effectively merges with the cemetery, although two stretches of dry-laid stone walling demarcate the two to the east of the church. The landscape of the church cemetery, punctuated by marble and granite gravestones, is dominated by the presence of aged cedars and English boxwood, old
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery
Guilford County, North Carolina

Section number 7 Page 2

and grown to great size, that were planted in specimen, paired, and border situations, and supplemented with crape myrtles, flowering shrubs, dogwoods, and other volunteer and planted trees, including a large, aged catalpa that was named to the "North Carolina Register of Big Trees" in 1984 by the North Carolina Department of Natural Resources and Community Development.

The additions to the church acreage in 1958 regularized its boundaries, as can be seen on the enclosed tax map (Guilford County, sheet #252), through the addition of two lots forming an L-shaped parcel on the south and east sides of the manse lot and a small 0.29-acre lot in the southeast corner of the church's major holding in the northeast corner of Church and Sixteenth streets. In 1964 White Oak Cemetery, Inc., deeded the narrow rectangular 0.96-acre lot lying between the west wall of the Cone family cemetery and the Buffalo Church grounds, formerly used for nursery operations, to the church. Since then, this grass-covered and partially shaded tract has been merged with the larger church cemetery and burial plots defined (in plan); many of the burials occurring at Buffalo Presbyterian Church since 1964 have occurred in this area.

1. Buffalo Presbyterian Church
   803 Sixteenth Street
   1827; 1920; 1951; 1956; 1966
   Contributing building

Buffalo Presbyterian Church is an imposing, symmetrical five-part brick plant comprising the original 1827 Federal-style gable-front brick church, renewed in the Colonial Revival style, and flanking two-story Colonial Revival-style educational buildings linked to the sanctuary by one-story arcades. This block of buildings represents the congregation's commitment to place, its increasing membership and programs (largely occurring in the twentieth century), and the adoption of the Colonial Revival style as the preferred mode in the twentieth century. From its completion in 1827 until 1919-1920, the rectangular, gable-front church, seen in a turn-of-the-century documentary photograph, and measuring forty feet wide and sixty deep, stood as built. A mortared stone foundation supported symmetrical two-story walls laid up in an unusual variant of English bond; three rows of stretcher brick alternate with one row of header brick. The three-bay façade on the south gable end featured paired entrances, fitted with double-leaf paneled doors, flanking a center window illuminating the vestibule; they are set in recessed, framed surrounds fitted with splayed stuccoed lintels with keystones. The trio of windows on the second-story, illuminating the balcony and an attic level window, are set in like surrounds except that their lintels lack keystones. The first story openings hold nine-over-nine sash while the second story has nine-over-six sash. All have louvered blinds. The long west and east side
United States Department of the Interior  
National Park Service  

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES  
CONTINUATION SHEET  

Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery  
Guilford County, North Carolina  

Section number 7  Page 3  

Elevations have a symmetrical five-part arrangement with corresponding windows on each level, in surrounds replicating those on the façade; the only departure was a first-story door in the southernmost bay on the east side that provided access to the balcony above the vestibule on the south end of the church. The appearance of the rear (north) elevation is not known. Likewise, the appearance of the interior is unknown prior to 1903 when “an arched ceiling was placed below the old high ceiling” (Rankin, 99).

In the 1919-1920 Colonial Revival updating and expansion of the church, the above-described, original fabric of the building was preserved, and an imposing Tuscan Porch was added to the façade, protecting the entrances and concealing only the attic window. Shallow, bracketed classical hoods were installed above the door openings, as well. Inside, the 1903 arched ceiling was enhanced and embellished with a beam and panel coved ceiling. A shallow alcove was built into the center of the north wall to house the pipes of the new organ. A two-story Colonial Revival Sunday School building, named the David Caldwell Building was added to the west and linked by a brick one-story three-part open arcade. At that time a doorway was opened at the west end of the vestibule onto the arcade.

The church stood for some thirty years in that form until a second series of Colonial Revival improvements was initiated. A second educational building, replicating the form and detailing of the David Caldwell Building was erected in 1951-1952 in a pendant position on the east side of the sanctuary, linked by a like three-part arcade, and named the Rachel Caldwell Building. With the “front” of the church plant established, the need for additional congregational seating in 1955 forced members to consider expansion to the back of the sanctuary. The original 1827 north wall was taken down and the sanctuary was extended some forty-three feet to the north, with rooms on either side of the enlarged chancel creating a “T” plan. The brickwork and finish of the 1827 building was replicated on the addition completed in 1956. Faced with different, larger needs in 1965, the church approved the demolition of the 1920 David Caldwell Building and its replacement by a larger like building with a substantial offset block on the west. With its completion in 1966, the Sixteenth Street front of the church plant was essentially the same in appearance as earlier, with the sunken west block, that also featured automobile access from North Church Street to the basement fellowship hall, effectively screened by small tree and shrub plantings.

The Three Blocks of the Church Plant

The center T-plan sanctuary block of Buffalo Presbyterian Church is dominated by a full-façade Tuscan portico supporting a stucco pediment fitted with a framed circular window. Six columns
across the front, with two paired at each end, and a shadow pilaster on the brick elevation rise to support a fully-modeled and well-detailed entablature with a paneled frieze embellished with triglyphs above the columns. The doorways are fitted with paired four-panel doors. The side elevations, extended by two symmetrical bays in 1956, extend north to the one-room wings each of which have eight-panel doors, below splayed lintels with keystones, on the south side. The east and west gable ends of the wings are two bays wide and fitted with six-over-six sash. On the rear elevation the wings have single windows in a position corresponding to their south entrances. The gable end of the sanctuary proper has a shallow one-story hip-roof projecting bay fitted with a door accessing the organ pipes, while a second service door is set to the east.

The front doors of the church open into the original vestibule that was refitted in the mid-1950s with handsome Georgian Revival woodwork and paneling and an inlaid linoleum floor that replicates more expensive marble flooring. A stair rises to the former balcony now fitted as a classroom. The center opening, fitted with paired eight-panel doors, opens onto the center-aisle-plan sanctuary with painted plaster walls above a paneled wainscot. The Colonial Revival-style fabric and appearance of the sanctuary reflects both the 1920 and mid-1950s renovation of the church. The beam-and-panel coved ceiling, whose appearance dates from the 1920 renovation, was retained and replicated for the two-bay extension of the sanctuary on its north end. The arched alcove housing the gilded organ pipes, added in 1920, was replaced by a wider, deeper alcove containing the choir, the gilded pipes in the center of the north wall, and incorporating a part of the raised chancel within its molded, arched frame. The seating and the brass chandeliers were added in the refitting program. Doors are set in the side walls of the chancel, behind the arch framing the opening, and they connect with the session room in the west wing and the church history room in the east wing. Secondary doors on each side of the choir connect with stairs descending to the robing room in the partial basement.

The Rachel Caldwell Building is a two-story hip-roof rectangular block linked to the sanctuary by a three-bay brick arcade whose materials and detailing replicate the earlier corresponding arcade on the west. The elevations are laid up in a novel bond with five courses of stretcher brick alternating with a course of alternating stretcher and header brick. A classical doorway with fluted pilasters is centered on its five-bay south façade. Corresponding window openings on each level hold eight-over-eight sash, and are visually linked by five inter-story brick framed marble panels. The first story windows have granite sills and soldier course lintels; the second story windows rest on a header string course that encircles the building and rise to a like string course at the base of the brick cornice also encircling the building. A pair of pedimented dormer vents are set in the front face of the asphalt-shingle roof. The five-bay east and west side elevations have a generally symmetrical appearance; on the east a long concrete well provides
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery
Guilford County, North Carolina

Section number 7  Page 5

protection to a series of windows illuminating the basement fellowship hall while two similar stairwells on the west side provide access to the hall. The rear elevation is dominated by a center chimney serving the fireplace in the fellowship hall, a third stairwell providing access to the hall, three corresponding windows and a fire escape for the second-story assembly hall. The simple but well-detailed interior of the building survives virtually intact and represents a good 1950s Colonial Revival institutional appearance. Steps descend from the first-story front lobby to the basement fellowship hall supported by a kitchen in the southwest corner. On the first story are two large Sunday School rooms, one for ladies and other used by both men and women. They are set on the east side of the center hall with classrooms and restrooms on the west side. A staircase rises to the large assembly room with an arched ceiling that occupies the entire second story; it incorporates a raised stage at its north end.

The exterior appearance of the main block of the 1966 David Caldwell Building is essentially the same as that of the Rachel Caldwell Building on its façade and east side, facing the sanctuary. The north elevation is generally symmetrical and with five bays holding corresponding windows on each story. The additional space in this building is contained in a large one-and-a-half-story brick block (on basement) which is offset by two bays behind the south façade and otherwise occupies most of the west elevation. It has four windows on its south elevation, three on its north side overlooking the cemetery, and five on the west; paired dormer windows are set in all three planes of its hip roof. On the west the basement is at grade and served by a driveway off North Church Street. Here a center entrance, flanked by large multi-pane bay windows opens into the fellowship hall with companion kitchen. The main and second-story levels of the David Caldwell Building contain offices, classrooms, the library, and a rehearsal area for the choir. The Georgian Revival finish of the entrance hall, pastor’s study, and church offices at the front of the building gives way to a simpler, more utilitarian finish throughout the rest of the building.

2. Buffalo Presbyterian Church Cemetery
   1775-1952 (and the present)
   Contributing site

Buffalo Presbyterian Church Cemetery, occupying the back (north) two-thirds of the church grounds on the north side of Sixteenth Street, is a historic church-related burying ground whose appearance reflects its continuous use, the stewardship of descendant generations, and fashions in gravestones from 1775 to the present. The character of the cemetery is formed by the historic gravestones, dating from 1775 to 1952, and the aged cedars, numerous nineteenth-century boxwood, spirea and other flowering shrubs, crape myrtles, dogwoods, and other shade trees, including the old, imposing catalpa that create a peaceful, gently-scented evergreen park-like...
atmosphere. The cemetery is generally rectangular in shape. The west border along North Church Street is marked by an informal stone wall, with both mortared and dry-laid sections, protected by a chain link fence on the street side, with volunteer trees and shrubs giving it the appearance of an old fence line or hedgerow. The longer north boundary is similar in its features and appearance, and is further enhanced with plantings of crape myrtle close along the fence line. On the east the cemetery is bounded by the iron fence, supported by granite piers, which enclose the Cone Family Cemetery on the east side of the church property. On the south, the western half of the boundary is essentially unmarked and the grass-covered cemetery effectively merges with the lawn surrounding the sanctuary and its attached educational buildings. A dry laid, nineteenth century stone wall leads off the northeast corner of the Rachel Caldwell Building to the east, separating the cemetery from the front lawn here. It is interrupted by a pair of granite uprights holding paired iron gates for foot passage. It connects in an informal way with a later, twentieth century dry-laid stone wall which carries across the east end of the south boundary and up to the Cone Cemetery’s southwest corner pier. Simple, inset stone piers support paired metal gates guarding a lane leading north off Sixteenth Street into the cemetery for vehicular traffic.

The earliest group of gravestones, dating from the eighteenth century and into the last half of the nineteenth century, is located in the area immediately north, northeast, and northwest of the church plant where the congregation’s first, log church and its second, frame church stood. Gravestones from the later nineteenth century and the first half of the twentieth century effectively merge with this core group on the west and east, and they, in turn, intermingle with mid to late-twentieth century graves and gravestones on the west and east edges of this “old section.” The rectangular “new section” of the cemetery lies on the east side of the aforementioned lane, between it and the Cone Family Cemetery. The eighteenth century interments and most of those in the nineteenth century are individually marked by single stones, mostly of a tablet form, and of white marble. In the twentieth century, the parallel graves of husbands and wives were often marked by a single stone, sometimes with individual footstones, while “family markers,” including that of the James W. Alexander (1870-1931) family, were erected for burial plots of multiple family members. Most of the twentieth century gravestones, whether historic and dating up to 1951, or later are grey granite and of a generally uniform size and consistency in their lettering and inscriptions. Because of the subtle gradation in age of the gravestones, from the center of the old section toward the edges of the cemetery, and the general conformity in scale and material, and repetition of family names there is no significant, intrusive contrast between the old and the new; instead, an abiding harmony prevails throughout the cemetery.
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery
Guilford County, North Carolina

Section number 7  Page 7

While burials likely began here in the later 1750s and certainly by the 1760s, the oldest surviving marked gravestone stands at the grave of Mary Starrat, the wife of Benjamin Starrat, who died on 20 March 1775. Attributed to carver Hugh Kelsey of Chester County, South Carolina, the slate tablet is carved with the figure of a dove, rising from earthly concerns symbolized by a globe and an hourglass, into heaven in the arch of the tablet and represented by a sun and moon inscribed “SOL” and “LUNA,” respectively (Sticks and Stones, 117-118). The appealing idiosyncratic folk-art character of this gravestone is in distinct contrast to the succession of gravestones during the next fifty to seventy-five years that, whether signed and stylish or plain, simple, and functional, have a remarkable consistency in scale, materials, design, and appearance. Within this group of mostly tablet stones with arched, scrolled, or paneled tops, are collections of family markers, including those for members of the Caldwell, Donnell, Gillespie, Hanner, Humphreys, Mitchell, Nicks, Rankin, and Wharton families, that, nevertheless, bespeak a greater affluence than that enjoyed by other members of Buffalo Presbyterian Church.

Except for some twenty or so signed gravestones, most are unsigned and appear to have been the products of local or regional stone carvers. The greatest number of the signed stones, at least thirteen with readable signatures, were produced by George Lauder (1810-1888) who operated a marble yard in Fayetteville from 1845 into the 1880s. Gravestones signed by Lauder, a Scotsman and Presbyterian, appear throughout central North Carolina and are particularly prominent in Presbyterian churchyards. Seven of the thirteen mark graves of members of the Donnell family: Polly (1799-1843); Anna (1783-1845); Joseph (1790-1845); Major Robert (1766-1847); Nancy (1832-1852); Elizabeth S. (1833-1853); and Robert A. Donnell (d. 1854). The other six stand at the graves of: Rev. Alexander Caldwell (d. 1841); Lucinda Wharton Hattrick (1809-1841); John W. Caldwell (1780-1844); Cornelia A. Holt Rich (1819-1847); Nancy T. Finley (d. 1851); and Samuel Mitchell, Sr. (1771-1851). Two handsome Federal-period gravestones were supplied by James Davidson, who operated a marble yard in Petersburg, Virginia, and installed many gravestones in Blandford Cemetery there: Mrs. Mary H. Humphreys (d. 1820), the wife of Henry Humphreys; and John Cunningham (1765-1821). The elegant gravestone of John Mitchell (1773-1847), the bachelor grandson of Adam Mitchell, was carved and signed by R. I. Brown of New York who enframed weeping willows in its scrolled upper panel. In the 1860s S. C. Robertson of Charlotte supplied the gravestones of Leonora Virginia Cunningham (d. 1864) and that of her mother Elizabeth C. Cunningham (d. 1867). The last in date of the visible signed gravestones stands at the grave of Joseph A. Mitchell (1857-1895); it was carved by J. W. Knight of Holt, North Carolina.

Of all the gravestones in the cemetery, the one that draws the most attention is the marble slab that lays over the grave of the Reverend David Caldwell who was buried here the day following
his death on 25 August 1824. In June 1825 his wife’s body was interred beside his and covered with a like marble slab; they are supported on a single granite base. The principal Caldwell plot is enclosed in a boxwood rectangle, and other members of the family are buried nearby. Other stones of note include: the truncated obelisk crowned by books and tasseled drapery at the grave of Reverend James Alexander (1831-1886); an elegant obelisk on a two-stage base marking the grave of James M. Donnell (1819-1881); the dark grey granite cross-form stones at the graves of David Wharton (1803-1902), ruling elder of the church for 54 years, and his son William David Wharton (1840-1907); and the rustic quarry-faced granite stone at the grave of Daniel M. Albright (1883-1926). As is typical of Presbyterian burying grounds, Buffalo Presbyterian Church Cemetery contains few lavishly ornamented “Victorian” gravestones or those with affecting inscriptions. The simple, traditional, classical gravestone forms favored by Presbyterians are predominate and they define the character of the burying ground. The gravestones erected at graves in the cemetery in the half-century since 1952 reflect those same preferences for substantial, well proportioned, simply inscribed stones of marble and granite, of good quality in design and workmanship. Their forms reflect a continuation of stone types favored in the first half of the twentieth century, and includes some inset, ground-level markers.

The cemetery has been cataloged twice. The first recording was undertaken by the Reverend Samuel Meek Rankin during the research leading to the publication of the History of Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Her People in 1934 and his genealogical work on the Rankin and Wharton families. He is buried in the cemetery. In 1994 Raymond Dufau Donnell’s modern survey was published by the Guilford County Genealogical Society. Mr. Donnell listed nearly 1,000 gravestones marking graves in the cemetery. Since his book was printed, about forty burials were recorded into spring 2000. Both Rev. Rankin and Mr. Donnell acknowledged the long-ago removal of simple fieldstones that anonymously marked graves.

3. The Manse
   800 Sixteenth Street
   1924
   Contributing building

In 1890 Buffalo Presbyterian Church supported the construction of its first manse at Bessemer that was a joint venture with Bethel and Midway churches with whom it then shared the services of Rev. Mr. Culbertson. In 1914, after Bethel withdrew its association in 1905, Buffalo Presbyterian Church contributed to the building of a second manse, on Cypress Street, in cooperation with Midway Church. The earlier manse was sold. In 1924, as Buffalo Presbyterian Church was preparing to receive Rev. Mr. Dickson, the congregation voted to erect this building
on 20 April, appointed a building committee, and charged it with erecting a building costing no more than $5,500. The plans for the manse are believed to have been drawn by Harry Barton. At a congregational meeting on 3 May, William Leslie Wharton (1881-1952) reported for the committee that “they could not build a creditable building such as we would need” for $5,500. The congregation voted to build this brick veneer residence at a cost of $7,260.

This rectangular two-story Colonial Revival-style residence, with a minimum of decorative finish, is laid up in common bond brick and covered with an asphalt-shingle hip roof; a double course of stretcher brick projects at the first story level as a water table while a single course of header brick forms a belt course incorporating the sills of the second-story windows. The window openings have soldier-course lintels, and a course of soldier brick forms a simple frieze at the top of the elevations, below the wood eaves. The center entrance on the north three-bay façade is protected by a simple pedimented porch with paneled tapering piers. The flanking bays to either side and in the corresponding bays above hold paired nine-over-one sash; a smaller window is set above the doorway. The appearance of the side elevations vary. On the west side a one-story hip roof porch (and perhaps partial sun room) was enclosed and glazed with six-over-six sash. A similar one-story hip roof frame service block on the rear (south) elevation has been enclosed with horizontal synthetic siding. The east elevation has a generally symmetrical appearance and includes paired windows illuminating the kitchen. The interior, following a center hall double-pile plan, has a good, substantial yet simple finish. The manse was last occupied as a residence by Rev. Mr. Huffstetler who resigned in 1985. Since then it has housed an elder day-care center.

4. Garage
   ca. 1924
   Contributing building

Probably contemporary with the manse, the garage is a one-story rectangular brick building covered with an asphalt-shingle hip roof; the common-bond elevations are finished with a soldier-course frieze under the eaves. Paired cross-braced wood doors protect the entrance on the north side. Small brick framed window openings are centered on the east and west sides.
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, Guilford County, North Carolina

Section number 8 Page 10


Architect/Builder: Barber, Richard--architect
Heritage, Thomas P.—architect

Summary

Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, occupying a site and grounds that have been the site of Presbyterian worship and Christian burial since ca. 1755 and whose core acreage was acquired in 1768 and enlarged through acquisitions in 1827, 1850, 1860, 1958 and 1964, occupies an important place in the history of Greensboro, Guilford County, and North Carolina. This property satisfies National Register Criteria A and B, possessing local significance in the areas of Early Settlement and Social History, and statewide significance in the area of Education due to its association with the Reverend David Caldwell, and also meets Criteria Consideration A and D.

The acre of land which Adam Mitchell conveyed to the trustees of the church in 1768 is believed to include the site where the Reverend Hugh McAden preached on 31 August 1755 to members of the Nottingham Colony of Scotch-Irish immigrants who settled ca. 1753 in the center of the area set apart in 1771 as Guilford County. A “meeting house and study house” was on the property in 1768, and since that time the congregation, organized in 1756 and the oldest Presbyterian congregation in Guilford County, has worshipped here in three known, successive log, frame, and brick churches and buried its deceased members in the hallowed ground surrounding these buildings. During the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries its landscape evolved from a pioneer wilderness to a prosperous rural agricultural community that could support the construction in 1827 of the oldest known surviving brick church erected in North Carolina. The church property took on a suburban aspect at the turn of the century, and finally in 1923 it became a part of the urban fabric of Greensboro through annexation. Buffalo Presbyterian Church has been inseparably associated with the settlement of the area and the social history of the county and its county seat. In Greensboro, North Carolina Ethel Stephens Arnett wrote “For almost 200 years Buffalo Church has been a community center of thought and worship. Among the many churches of which Greensboro is justly proud, it alone has watched every development in and around the city from its first settlement.”

Fame came early to the church in the person of the Reverend David Caldwell (1725-1824) who was installed by Mr. McAden as the first minister of Buffalo Church in 1768. David Caldwell served as pastor of the congregation here and at Alamance Presbyterian Church until retiring at
the age of ninety-five in 1820. He died on 25 August 1824 and was buried in the Buffalo Churchyard. In 1842, when his successor the Reverend Eli Washington Caruthers issued A Sketch of the Life and Character of the Rev. David Caldwell, D.D., he became the subject of the first known biography of a minister published in North Carolina. However, his significance in the history of Guilford County and North Carolina does not reside with his pastoral responsibilities but rather with his transcendent role as an educator and his operation of a “Log College” from ca. 1767 into the early years of the nineteenth century. Mr. Caruthers noted that “five of his scholars became governors of different states; many more members of Congress, some of whom occupied high standing... and a much greater number became lawyers, judges, physicians, and ministers of the gospel.” North Carolina historian Stephen B. Weeks (1865-1918) later wrote that “none (in his time) did a nobler or more enduring work toward the greatness of the state than the Rev. David Caldwell, D.D., preacher, teacher, and physician, counsellor and guide for his friends and neighbors, servant of the people in many ways, state builder and protagonist of learning in the wilderness of North Carolina.” And finally, in 1888, in The History of Education in North Carolina, Charles Lee Smith (1865-1951) wrote “The most illustrious name in the educational history of North Carolina is that of the Rev. David Caldwell, D.D.” This assessment of his reputation has held to the present.

The period of significance for Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery begins in 1775, the date of the oldest surviving gravestone, that of Mary Starrat (1723-1775) who died on 20 March 1775, and continues to 1952. The period embraces the years in which the church and its burying ground held critical importance in the history of Guilford County and Greensboro for its association with the settlement of the region and as the site of continuous Presbyterian worship and burial, and those in which its members built their third, brick church, which they embellished and refitted in 1903, 1919, 1951, 1956 and 1966 to serve a growing congregation whose roots are among the deepest in piedmont North Carolina. No other standing resources are known to exist from the eighteenth century in Greensboro, therefore the cemetery specifically qualifies for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under Criterion A for Early Settlement and Social History and Criterion Consideration D due to its age. The period following 1952 does not possess exceptional significance, and therefore the period of significance ends with the fifty-year cut-off date for the National Register criteria.
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, the Reverend David Caldwell, and the Scotch Irish Settlement in Central Guilford County, 1755-1824

Standing today in a mixed neighborhood, north and northwest of Cone Mills’ massive White Oak and Revolution mills and villages, and bordered on the east by the Cone Family Cemetery and Mausoleum, Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery marks a place that has been the site of religious observances and burials for nearly 250 years, that has important associations with the early settlement of Guilford County and Greensboro, and that has strong associations with the life and celebrated career of Rev. David Caldwell (1725-1824) who was installed as pastor in 1768 and remained in the pulpit until 1820. The church was the first, central institution of the Nottingham Colony which settled here in the early 1750s on lands watered by North Buffalo Creek from which the settlement and the church drew their name. The Scotch-Irish who came here, into the center of an area comprising portions of Rowan and Orange counties that was formed into Guilford County in 1771, were the third of three ethnic colonies that settled present-day Guilford County in the decades preceding the Revolutionary War. Beginning in the 1740s, German-speaking settlers, traveling on the Great Wagon Road from Pennsylvania through the Shenandoah Valley of Virginia and into Piedmont North Carolina, took up lands in what is now eastern Guilford County. A few years later, Quakers from New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Maryland, Virginia, and eastern North Carolina chose lands in western and southern Guilford County. By a year or two, they were followed by the Nottingham Colony of Scotch-Irish who purchased lands between the two earlier arrivals, in central Guilford County. All three communities of immigrants brought societal institutions; the German settlers established Lutheran and Reformed congregations, sometimes meeting in shared “Union Churches” until building separate buildings for their respective congregations; the Quakers established houses for the several meetings comprising their colony and quickly established schools; the Scotch-Irish made Presbyterian churches the center of their settlement and were likewise quick to establish schools. Through the course of some 250 years to the present, the Quaker and Scotch-Irish communities and their institutions became dominant in Guilford County and Greensboro, its county seat. Quaker meetings, including Deep River, continue today, and the Quaker boarding school at New Garden, chartered in 1834 and now known as Guilford College, is the oldest surviving educational institution in the county. While the schools established and operated by the leaders of Scotch-Irish settlement, including David Caldwell’s Log College, did not survive, children of the settlement and the congregation figured prominently among the founders of Greensboro, and their Presbyterian church and its creed became a principal voice of the city of Greensboro where its First Presbyterian congregation, a daughter of Buffalo Church, worships in the resplendent
Hobart Upjohn-designed Romanesque Revival-style church that is the most conspicuous religious building in a city of imposing churches and synagogues. 1

The settlement of the area that is now Guilford County and the development of a community centered on Buffalo Presbyterian Church were part of the larger migration into central, colonial North Carolina in the 1740s and 1750s. (Robert W. Ramsey's Carolina Cradle: Settlement of the Northwest Carolina Frontier, 1747-1762, focusing on the Rowan County/Yadkin River settlements, is one of the best studies of this cultural relocation.) While Quakers formed important communities in Guilford and present-day Randolph counties, and Moravians established settlements at Bethabara (NHL 1999), Salem (NHL, 1966), and Bethania (NHL, 2001), the Scotch-Irish and German immigrants comprised the two largest groups of settlers in the Piedmont. The pattern of settlement seen in Guilford County was repeated throughout the region with one ethnic group or the other taking up the best available lands on arrival. In what is now Rowan County the Scotch-Irish settled in the fertile, western part of the county and developed communities around Thyatira (NR, 1984) and Third Creek (NR, 1983) churches, while German-speaking settlers acquired lands in eastern Rowan County and made Grace “Lower Stone” Reformed Church (NR, 1972) and Zion “Organ” Lutheran Church (NR, 1972), the focus of community life. A similar pattern appertained in the settlement of the area of Rowan that eventually became Cabarrus County in 1792 where Rocky River Presbyterian Church (NR, 1986), organized ca. 1755, was the center of a prosperous Scotch-Irish community. Further south, in present-day Mecklenburg County, the Scotch-Irish were the dominant group and established a series of Presbyterian churches, including Sugaw Creek and Hopewell (NR, 1996) churches while Catawba County and much of Lincoln County was largely settled by German-speaking pioneers who organized Old St. Paul’s (NR, 1971), Daniels, and Salem (NR, 1995) churches. In the instances cited above a portion of the church yard was set aside for burials of church members and community residents. Usually, as here at Buffalo Church, the earlier (pioneer generation) interments were simply marked by field stones, and it was not until the last quarter of the eighteenth century that locally-made or imported gravestones were erected and survive in any significant number. This pairing of a church and burying ground at a single site forms an important cultural feature in piedmont North Carolina and reflects the early settlement of particular communities and counties where very few contemporary houses or other buildings survive from the mid- and later-eighteenth century.

Exactly when the Scotch-Irish first came to the lands on North Buffalo Creek and settled here is not known; however, they were here by December 1753, the date of a series of deeds by which they established title to property. Some two years later, on 31 August 1755, the Rev. Hugh
McAden preached to members of the settlement, after being at Hawfields, and recorded the event in his diary.

Wednesday came to Buffalo settlement, about thirty five miles; lodged at William Mebane’s till Sabbath day; then rode to Adam Mitchell’s where I preached. The people seemed solemn and very attentive, but no appearance of the life of religion. Returned in the evening, about a mile to Robert Rankin’s, where I was kindly received and well entertained till Tuesday; then returned to the former place and preached; no stir appeared, but some tears (Rankin, 19).

That condition soon changed; whether in fact Buffalo Presbyterian Church was organized in 1756, the traditionally accepted date, or later, ca. 1760, it was on sure footing by 1765 when Buffalo and Alamance churches issued a joint call for a minister. (Alamance Church, the county’s second oldest Presbyterian congregation, was organized ca. 1762 and is located in Guilford County to the southeast of Greensboro.) That call was answered by the Presbytery of New Brunswick (New Jersey) in the person of Rev. David Caldwell who was installed as pastor of the churches in 1768. The life and career of the Reverend Mr. Caldwell, as a minister, as an educator, a doctor, and statesman was thereafter linked with Buffalo Church where he remained in the pulpit until 1820 when he was ninety-five years of age. He died four years later on 25 August 1824 and was buried in the Buffalo churchyard.

David Caldwell joined a community of prospering Presbyterians and he contributed in every important way to its advancement. Buffalo Church established itself at this site on a one-acre tract acquired on 16 October 1768 from Adam Mitchell, Mr. McAden’s host in 1755. Trustees John McKnight and William Anderson received the property (Rowan County Deeds, 7/72). The first church built by the congregation was log; the second known building was frame. The congregation of Buffalo Church was made up of Scotch-Irish Presbyterians most of whom at first were members of the Nottingham colony. The Nottingham colony acquired thirty-three sections of 640 acres each (for a total of 21,120 acres) from Earl Granville’s agents; the deeds conveying sections or part sections to individual settlers are mostly dated in December 1753 (Rankin, 14-15). These included members of the Cunningham, Donnell, Mitchell, Nicks, and Rankin families, among others, who lie buried in the Buffalo Churchyard in marked graves while countless others occupy unmarked graves. Some of these pioneering settlers acquired one section (640 acres) of land for their farms while others acquired more, or less. Thomas Donnell (1712-1759) acquired three sections (1,920 acres) while his brother Robert Donnell, Sr. acquired two sections. Their prominence and affluence is reflected in the sophisticated Donnell family gravestones at Buffalo Church. Members of these families intermarried with the Denny,
Gillespie, McAdoo, and Wharton families, and others, and they, too, are buried here as are their descendants. The original colony was enlarged by both births and new arrivals including John Rankin (1736-1814) who purchased land on the north side of Buffalo Creek in 1765. Accounts of these families and dozens of others, appear in History of Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Her People published by subscription in 1934 by the Reverend Samuel Meek Rankin (1864-1939), the great-grandson of the above John Rankin, who is also buried here.

The Reverend David Caldwell ministered to the congregation of Buffalo Church in their successive log and frame churches for a period of about fifty-five years, from 1768 until 1820 when he resigned at the age of ninety-five. During this long period he pastored his congregation through the Battle of the Regulators, the Revolutionary War, and the War of 1812 for which he exhorted members of his congregation to volunteer for service. Guilford County was formed from old Rowan and Orange counties in 1771 and the new county seat, Guilford Courthouse was established in 1774. After the formation of Randolph County from southern Guilford in 1779 and Rockingham County from northern Guilford in 1785, agitation developed for a new county seat; David Caldwell, Jr., was one of the commissioners appointed in 1807 to select a new central location, and they chose land centered on the intersection of present day Market and Elm streets. Dr. David Caldwell, Jr., and his brother Thomas Caldwell became citizens of the new town of Greensboro. The crossing of Elm and Market Streets was but two and three-fourths miles south of Buffalo Church, and the Presbyterian residents of Greensboro continued to worship at Buffalo Church until 1824.

Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Her Brick Sanctuary: A Congregation Grows in an Evolving Community, 1825-1913

The retirement of the Reverend David Caldwell in 1820 and his death in 1824, resulted in the arrival of the Reverend Eli Washington Caruthers as the second minister of Buffalo Presbyterian Church, the organization of the First Presbyterian Church in Greensboro, and the erection of a new brick sanctuary here in 1827, three of whose intact walls enclose the building in use today. At his death on 25 August 1824 the Reverend David Caldwell was buried the next day in the churchyard at Buffalo Church. (The following year his wife Rachel was buried beside him). A month and a half later, on 3 October 1824, a meeting was held in Greensboro to organize the First Presbyterian Church. With the arrival of the Reverend Eli Washington Caruthers (1793-1865) as minister at Buffalo Presbyterian Church in 1821, having accepted a joint call from Buffalo, Alamance, and Bethel churches, discussion arose concerning the erection of a new church. At a meeting in May 1826, the congregation voted to build a new building, not to exceed $2,000 in cost, and a committee of five was appointed to raise funds and supervise its
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery

Guilford County, North Carolina

Section number 8 Page 16

construction. Its members were: Major Robert Donnell (1766-1847); John W. Caldwell (1780-1844); Robert Moderwell (d. 1836); Henry Humphrey (1787-1840); and Col. William T. Shields. A few weeks later, on 10 June 1826, the committee reported receipt of a bid to erect the new church for $2,400 plus the old building; the bid was approved.

The contract for the church, measuring sixty feet in length and forty feet in width, with a gallery across the south end, was let to Jacob Albright (1791-1847), a member of the church. Joseph Kirkpatrick (1804-1859), also a member of the church, assisted. The brick were molded and fired on a lot just west of the church. A ten-foot wide vestibule was devised at the front of the building, with the partition wall supporting the front of the balcony. The church was apparently completed near the end of 1827. At a congregational meeting on 16 January 1828 the decision was made to forego new pews and adjust the old ones to fit. The first services in the new church were held shortly thereafter. Except for re-roofing and the usual repairs, the church remained as built until 1903. A turn-of-the-century photograph shows it to have been a handsome well-finished gable-front brick church, standing on a stone foundation with stuccoed lintels, paired entrances on the south façade, flanking a window, and a third door on the east side for access to the gallery; a trio of windows are set in the façade’s second story, with an attic window above, while double tiers of windows occupy the five symmetrical bays of the side elevations. Concurrent with the building of the new church, an adjoining tract of two and three-fourths acres was bought of the estate of Dr. Caldwell on 20 September 1827 (Guilford County Deeds, 18/600).

The erection of a brick church by the Buffalo congregation in 1827 represented a real degree of accomplishment and status for the Scotch-Irish community that comprised its membership. Buffalo Church was an altogether more prepossessing building than Guilford’s first rural brick church, a small building erected by the German congregation at Whitsett in 1813 that was pulled down because of structural weakness and rebuilt in 1839-1841. As far as can now be determined, Buffalo Presbyterian Church was the first brick church built by a rural Presbyterian congregation in North Carolina, and it is believed to be the earliest, surviving brick church erected by a rural congregation of any denomination in the state. In 1829 the Orange Presbytery undertook a survey of church buildings within its purview and appointed “The Committee on Church Buildings . . . whose duty it shall be to ascertain the number, location, material, size, cost, time of dedication, the number of sittings for white and for blacks of the Presbyterian Houses of worship within our bounds, and also an application with plans, estimate of expense of such buildings . . .” (Orange, 159). Of the thirty-three churches recorded, five were brick, five were built of logs, and twenty-three were frame construction. The largest churches, measuring sixty by forty feet, stood in Raleigh, Hawfields, and at Buffalo. And within the group
the cost of Buffalo Church, at $3,000 was the fourth highest in the presbytery, but well below First Presbyterian in Raleigh at $16,000, First Presbyterian in New Bern at $7,000, and the $5,000 church at Washington. In the event the Buffalo Church was the first of a series of brick churches erected in the Piedmont in the decades preceding the Civil War which defined the status and affluence of Presbyterian communities in antebellum North Carolina. The Hopewell congregation in Mecklenburg County soon built a brick church (NR, 1996), as did Third Creek in Rowan County in 1835 (NR, 1983), and numerous others in both the Orange and Concord presbyteries erected imposing handsome, mostly Greek Revival-style brick churches in the years up to 1861.

The construction of the brick church in 1827 at this location reflects both the pattern of church architecture in piedmont North Carolina and the growth of the pioneer settlement as well as the commitment of the Buffalo congregation to place and tradition. It stands as the third known church building erected at this site as a house of worship, and it reflected the rise in social status and the sequence of architectural development seen throughout central and western North Carolina where rural congregations first erected a log church that was replaced in time by a more prepossessing frame church which, in turn, gave way to a handsome brick building when the fortunes of a community increased. In short, the continued development and use of this site reflects the social history and accomplishment of these prominent people and their community. The first church was built of log construction either in the late 1750s or early 1760s since an existing “meeting house and study house” were cited in the 1768 deed. Mr. Rankin wrote in 1934 that it “stood inside the present cemetery, and near the northwest corner” (Rankin, 97). The loss of critical church records for much of the period from 1779 to 1833 renders it difficult to determine when the log church was replaced. Mr. Rankin states “The second church was a large frame building, and stood near the southwest corner of the present cemetery” (Rankin, 97). The construction of the brick church in 1827 occurred here, as it sometimes did elsewhere, long before few if any members of the congregation were able or sought to build brick houses for themselves. Their primary investment, instead, was made in their church, the symbol and center of their society.

The Reverend Mr. Caruthers remained in the pulpit of both Buffalo and Alamance Presbyterian Churches until 1846 when he resigned Buffalo; he served Alamance Church until resigning in 1861. At his death four years later he was buried in its churchyard. During the Buffalo ministry, he pursued historical subjects, and published the first of three books, A Sketch of the Life and Character of the Reverend David Caldwell, D.D. in 1842. With a certain fitness reflecting the bonds of family and church, Rev. Mr. Caruthers was succeeded in 1847 by a grandson of David Caldwell, Rev. Cyrus K. Caldwell (1821-1876); the son of the Reverend Samuel C. Caldwell, he
was educated at Davidson College and Union Theological Seminary. Early in his tenure, in 1850, the church expanded its property here by the purchase of just over two acres on the west (Guilford County Deeds, 32/208). After his resignation in 1859 the church purchased two and a half acres on the east and northeast from Robert C. Donnell (Guilford County Deeds, 37/805). Buffalo Church’s fourth minister, the Reverend James Calvin Alexander (1831-1886) served for twenty-five years, from 1861 until his unexpected death on 15 November 1886, and saw the church through the difficult war years and those that followed. He was buried in the yard at Buffalo Church.

Mr. Alexander was the last of the school of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Presbyterian ministers who committed the larger part of their ministry to a single church. Those who succeeded him served relatively short ministries. The Reverend Richard Watt Culbertson (1860-1932) came to Buffalo Church in 1887, the same year he, too, graduated from Union Theological Seminary, and remained here into 1892. He oversaw the church’s involvement with the congregation at Midway, the building of a church for the young body, and the erection in 1890 of a manse at Bessemer, a joint effort of Buffalo, Bethel, and Midway churches, which he served. The pastorate of the Reverend Josiah McLeod Seabrook (1852-1905), from 1892 to 1904, was the first during which a series of improvements to the 1827 church plant were made in the early twentieth century. On 16 August 1903 the congregation approved repairs to the church and the installation of “an arched ceiling . . . below the old high ceiling” (Rankin, 99), presumably to conserve heat. This was the first physical change to the building since 1876 when it “was recovered and otherwise repaired and improved” (Rankin, 99). Mr. Seabrook was succeeded by the church’s third pastor from Rowan County, the Reverend James William Goodman (1867-1924) who served Buffalo Church together with the small Midway and Bessemer churches from 1905 into 1911. The shortest pastorate in the history of the church was that of its next minister, the Reverend George W. Oldham (1879-1964) who preached at Buffalo from May 1912 until resigning in July 1913.

Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Its Colonial Revival-Style Improvements, 1913-1966

The first half of the twentieth century was a period of marked change in the life and fabric of Buffalo Presbyterian Church, one defined by actions that reflected its increasing membership, enlarged religious programs for its members, the evolving character of its community, and the growth of Greensboro’s population. During this period the rural setting of the church changed to an increasingly suburban appearance and finally, in 1923, it and the surrounding area were annexed and became part of the urban fabric of one of the principal industrial cities of North Carolina. While accurate membership figures for the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries are not
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery
Guilford County, North Carolina
Section number 8    Page 19

(readily) available, the addition of 211 new members in the decade-long pastorate (1913-1923) of the Reverend Eli Franklin Lee (1878-1930) reflects an increase that was both dramatic and probably more socially diverse. This occurred as the Cone family mills enlarged their plants and village housing in the area and increased residential development followed suit. In 1829, two years after the completion of the brick church, a local census put Greensboro’s population at 369; by 1900, shortly before the church undertook building improvements, the city’s population stood at 10,035. In 1926 with both the annexation and building improvements completed the federal estimate of the population was 48,500, and by 1930 it had increased five-fold since 1900 to 53,569. During the next twenty years the population increased to 74,389 in 1950, the church membership grew, and planning was initiated for the Rachel Caldwell Building (Arnett, Greensboro, 419-420). Coincident with these increases, growth in the Sunday School department, youth work, women’s activities and association, and the men’s Bible class pressed for additional physical facilities. “Sabbath School” which began in the nineteenth century on Sundays when the minister was serving another church on the charge evolved into a broad program offering Sunday School classes and religious instruction for all ages each Sunday. The women’s association, reorganized in 1907 and renamed the Woman’s Auxiliary of Buffalo Church in 1917 to conform with church structure, undertook a range of programs and good works in addition to serving meals that increasingly figured in the life of the congregation here as elsewhere. A kitchen and dining hall were erected in the basement of the Rachel Caldwell Building. Through this growth and sequence of changes, Buffalo Presbyterian Church retained its links with the past, remained the site of congregational and community activity, and reflected the social history of the congregation, community, and city.

In 1919, under the leadership of the Reverend Mr. Lee, the church undertook two important building projects. On 2 July 1919 the session met for “the discussion of changes in the church, as to digging a basement, or building a new Sunday school building, and building a portico with colonial columns to the present building.” The proposal for improved facilities for the Sunday School was unanimously passed by the session and the minister was asked “to see Mr. Harry Barton the architect, and ask him to submit plans, etc.” (Session Minutes, 2 July 1919). Harry Barton (1876-1938) was one of the most talented architects working in Greensboro in the first decades of the twentieth century. Trained in the office of the Supervising Architect of the Treasury, he came to Greensboro in 1912 and quickly established his office and reputation. His monumental Classical Revival-style Guilford County Court House was completed in 1918. An elder in the First Presbyterian Church from 1917 until his death, he was a consulting architect to Hobart Upjohn on the great church erected at the head of Fisher Park. The recommendations of Mr. Barton for a new Sunday School building were generally approved, as was the formation of a building committee, at a congregational meeting on 14 July 1919. The design of the portico
and the Sunday School building reflected the denomination's favor of the Colonial Revival style for church building projects in the opening decades of the twentieth century.

With architectural plans in hand the church launched a fund-raising campaign on 19 October 1919. Alfred Moore Scales (1870-1940), a prominent civic and business leader in Greensboro, offered the principal address on the “Life and Labors of Dr. Caldwell.” Included on the roster of speakers were Bernard Cone and Emanuel Sternberger, representing the neighboring White Oak and Revolution mills, respectively, and Fred A. Olds (Rankin, 172). During the gubernatorial term (1885-1889) of Governor Alfred Moore Scales, Mr. Olds had undertaken the collection of state records and artifacts which, housed first in the State Library and the Fred A. Olds Hall of History, formed the foundation of the North Carolina State Archives and Museum of History. Work started soon thereafter was completed in 1920. A second congregational meeting was called in September 1920, probably during the course of construction; “the purpose of the meeting was to decide whether the Congregation desired to carry out the recommendation of architect of (sic) Harry Barton as to the interior finish of the church and, if we should build an alcove back of the pulpit in preparation for a Pipe organ” (Session Minutes, 5 September 1920). The work, including the surviving paneled and coved ceiling, estimated at $3,000 was approved.

The congregation’s new Moller pipe organ, the third organ known to have been used at Buffalo Church, was the gift of Alfred Moore Scales in memory of his son Alfred Moore Scales IV (1898-1918) who died in service in World War I (see World War Memorial Stadium, NR, 2001). The Sunday School addition, named the David Caldwell Building, was a two-story Colonial Revival-style brick building on the west of the sanctuary and connected to the church by an arcade; it contained nine classrooms for use by the children’s, youth, and adult Sunday School classes.

Mr. Lee was succeeded in the pastorate at Buffalo by the Reverend Albert Pickett Dickson (1886-1974), who arrived in July 1924 and remained in the pulpit until 1956 during which time three further building projects were completed. In spring 1924 two congregational meetings were held in regard to the construction of a new manse to replace the one built in 1914 in cooperation with Midway Church; a building committee was appointed, the decision was made to locate the manse at its present location, and to build it of frame construction with brick veneer for an approximate sum of $7,260.00 (Session Minutes, 20 April and 3 May 1924). The construction of the manse here consolidated all church-related activities at one site, reflected the dissolution of pastoral and congregational ties with Midway Church, and located the minister at the church to which he was giving his full-time attention.
In the 1950s two further projects answered increasing membership and congregational needs and reflected improvements to the church plant. In summer 1951 architect Richard Barber completed plans for a second educational building, following the design of the Harry Barton’s David Caldwell Building, which was located on the east side of the sanctuary and connected to it by an arcade that carried from the original (1827) gallery door on its east side to the new facility. It was named the Rachel Caldwell Building and contained a fellowship/dining hall and well-equipped kitchen in the basement level, the ladies parlor, classrooms, and restrooms on the first story, and a large auditorium for informal gatherings, lectures, etc., on the second story. This new building was indeed an improvement to Buffalo Church and created a balanced, symmetrical composition with the David and Rachel Caldwell buildings flanking the central sanctuary, and linked to it by identical three-bay one-story arcades. The next project was undertaken in a like spirit and because of the same pressing needs of an increased membership. A congregational meeting was held on 27 March 1955 “to discuss the renovating and enlarging of the main sanctuary” (Session Minutes, 27 March 1955). Although the minutes for the meeting are brief and provide little insight into the thinking of the church leaders, the point under discussion was whether to take down the north gable end of the church and extend the nave some forty-three feet to the north, and add wings (giving the church a T-plan), thereby providing for additional congregational seating, a larger chancel and choir area, space for robeing, and offices. Thomas P. Heritage, an architect and member of Buffalo, explained the proposal. The project was approved by a vote of seventy-five in favor to five nays. Brown Construction Company, which had built the Rachel Caldwell Building, completed the expansion of the sanctuary in 1956. Meanwhile, in 1951, a North Carolina Highway Historical Marker was erected on U. S. 29 in recognition of Buffalo Church’s historic significance; ca. 1976, it was relocated to the front lawn of the church property.

In retrospect, the decision to enlarge the historic church and its sanctuary by taking down the north wall and extending it into the cemetery grounds was a consideration not altogether unique to this congregation. At both Salem Church (Lincoln County) and Hopewell Church (Mecklenburg County) similar enlargements had occurred in the nineteenth century. Other churches, in both the later nineteenth and first half of the twentieth century, dealt with the matter in other ways, most often replacing the existing church with a new building. That was the case at Alamance Presbyterian Church, Guilford County’s second colonial, and only other eighteenth-century, Presbyterian congregation. Its original log church was succeeded by a frame church that gave way in 1844 to a brick church (of apparently inferior construction); it was replaced by a second brick church ca. 1874 to which wings were added and the whole building pulled down and replaced by the present, very large church in 1966. In 1955-1956 at Buffalo Church the present-day view of architectural integrity apparently did not figure in the discussion by the congregation which reaffirmed its commitment to place and appreciation of its past through this
expansion of its historic church. That said, however, a conscious and deliberate effort was made to reproduce the original brick color and size in the addition.

The present appearance of Buffalo Presbyterian Church was achieved when yet another building project was completed in 1966 during the pastorate of Rev. Gray Watson Hampton (b. 1928), who succeeded Rev. Edward Lee Willingham III (b. 1927) in 1962. The church membership had grown to over 500 in the early 1960s, and further need for additional and different facilities was voiced. The congregation decided to take down the existing 1921 David Caldwell Building and replace it with a building of like design but larger in plan and with a full basement that was accessible at grade from a motor court off North Church Street. Designed by Mr. Heritage and erected by Joslin Construction Company at a cost of some $237,000, the building provided a large new fellowship/dining hall and kitchen in the basement, a library, pastor’s study, church offices, and a choir rehearsal room on the first story, and classrooms on the second story.

Through transactions in 1958 and 1964 the church grounds were enlarged slightly on the south and east. On 7 August 1958, in two deeds, Cone Mills Corporation conveyed the lots on the south and east sides of the then existing manse lot, on the south side of Sixteenth Street, to the trustees of Buffalo Church (Guilford County Deeds, 1787/548, 552). On 31 August 1958 White Oak Cemetery, Inc., conveyed a small 0.29-acre tract on the north side of Sixteenth Street and in the extreme southeast corner of the church grounds so as to even out its boundaries (Guilford County Deeds, 1789/112). Later, on 20 October 1964, the cemetery holding company conveyed a narrow rectangular 0.94-acre lot, lying between the church property and the fenced Cone Family Cemetery, to the church (Guilford County Deeds, 2178/355).

Buffalo Presbyterian Church, 1967-2001

The Reverend Mr. Hampton resigned from Buffalo Church in 1968, and he was succeeded by the Reverend Edsel Marion Huffstetler (b. 1923) in 1969. Rev. Huffstetler, who served as minister at Buffalo into 1985, was its last pastor to occupy the church manse, which subsequently became an elder day-care center. The Reverend Christopher Frank East became the church’s fourteenth minister in 1987 and served the congregation until 1997. After the services of an interim minister, Dr. Jesse Bledsoe, the present pastor, came to Buffalo Church in March 2000. In December 2000 Buffalo Church and Cemetery, together with the manse, was designated a historic property by the Guilford County Historic Preservation Commission.
NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET

Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery
Guilford County, North Carolina

Education Context and the Reverend David Caldwell

The statewide significance of Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery in the area of education and its satisfaction of National Register Criterion B and Criterion Consideration D lies in its association with the life and career of the Reverend David Caldwell (1725-1824) who served as pastor of the church from 1768 to 1820 and who was buried here at his death on 25 August 1824. No other building or surviving site bears such strong associations with a man who has been lauded through the course of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries for his role in education in North Carolina. Notwithstanding the praise accorded him by the Reverend Eli Washington Caruthers in A Sketch of the Life and Character of the Rev. David Caldwell in 1842, the first scholarly assessment of David Caldwell’s position in the history of education in North Carolina came in 1888 with the publication of The History of Education in North Carolina, written by Charles Lee Smith (1865-1951), a fellow in history and politics at John Hopkins University, and published by the Government Printing Office in 1888.

The most illustrious name in the educational history of North Carolina is that of the Rev. David Caldwell, D. D. For many years “his log cabin served for North Carolina as an academy, a college, and a theological seminary.” An able Presbyterian divine, the Rev. E. B. Currie, says that “Dr. Caldwell as a teacher, was probably more useful to the church than any one man in the United States.” In 1766 or '67 Dr. Caldwell established his classical school in Guilford County, at that time the north-eastern part of Rowan County, about three miles from where Greensborough now stands. It soon became one of the most noted schools of the South, and we are told that to have passed through the course of study given here, with the approbation of the teacher, was a sufficient recommendation for scholarship in any section of the South.

Dr. Caldwell was a full graduate of Princeton, and such was his reputation as an instructor and disciplinarian, that in his school were students from all of the States south of the Potomac. It is claimed that he was instrumental in bringing more men into the learned professions than any other man of his day, certainly in the Southern States. While many of his students continued their studies at Princeton, and at the University of North Carolina after the establishment of that institution, the larger number, and several of those who became the most distinguished in after-life, never went anywhere else for instruction, nor enjoyed other advantages for higher education than those afforded at his school. His biographer (Mr. Caruthers) says: “Five of his scholars became Governors of different States;
many more members of Congress, some of whom occupied a high standing, and still (1842) occupy it; and a much greater number became lawyers, judges, physicians, and ministers of the gospel. It would be a credit to any man to have been the instructor of such men as Judge Murphey, Judge McCoy, and many others who, in the same road to honor and usefulness, fell very little, if any, behind them; and to one who knew the value and importance of religion as he did, it must have been a matter of very pleasant reflection that he had been instrumental in bringing into the gospel ministry such men as the Rev. Samuel E. McCorkle, D. D., and the Rev. John Anderson, D. D., . . . (Smith, 27).

David Caldwell was born in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania, on 22 March 1725, the son of Andrew and Martha Caldwell. He graduated from the College of New Jersey (now Princeton University) in 1761, and in 1763 he was licensed by the Presbytery of New Brunswick. Meeting in May 1765 the Presbytery appointed him “to labor at least one whole year as a missionary in North Carolina” (Caruthers, 21), and on 6 July 1765 he was ordained in Trenton. At the same time he was dismissed to the Presbytery of Hanover (Virginia) which then embraced North Carolina, and he was accepted into that body in October 1767 when a petition to have him serve as minister of Buffalo and Alamance Presbyterian churches was granted. He was installed at Buffalo Church on 3 March 1768 by the Rev. Hugh McAden. During this period he had established himself in Guilford County, probably coming first in 1764; the deed for his farm some three or four miles southwest of Buffalo Church, a tract of about 500 acres on the headwaters of North Buffalo Creek bought from John Blair (d. 1778) is dated 3 January 1765 (Rowan County Deeds, 6/39-40). His acceptance into the first rank of Presbyterian society was reinforced in 1766 by marriage to Rachel Craighead (17—1825), the daughter of the Rev. Alexander Craighead, pastor of Sugaw Creek Church, and a granddaughter and great-granddaughter of Presbyterian ministers. In 1767 the Reverend Mr. Caldwell opened his classical academy at their farm.

The extent to which the events of the Revolutionary War interrupted or temporarily suspended the operation of his school is unconfirmed. His role as a patriot and statesman in the 1770s and as a delegate to the Provincial Congress in Halifax in 1776 and to the Constitutional Convention in Hillsborough were described by Mr. Caruthers in his biography that was the first biography of a minister and educator published in North Carolina and by later-day historians including Blackwell P. Robinson who penned the entry for David Caldwell appearing in volume one of the Dictionary of North Carolina Biography (Powell, 300-302).
After the war, Caldwell returned to his school, his churches, his medical practice, and his farm. In 1794 he was offered the first presidency of The University of North Carolina, because “beyond a doubt he was recognized as the leading educator of the state.” Declining this offer, he continued to teach at his Log College until old age compelled him to retire, though as late as 1816 he was instructing a number of private students, among whom were John Motley Morehead and Archibald Debow Murphey, and he continued his ministry until 1820, when he was ninety-five (Powell, 301).

John Motley Morehead (1796-1866) would later serve as governor of North Carolina (1841-1845) while Archibald Debow Murphey became a forceful advocate for internal improvements in North Carolina.

Note should also be taken of David Caldwell’s role in the Great Revival. The Reverend James McGready (1763-1817), whose preaching at Gasper, Kentucky, in spring 1798 is acknowledged as the first camp meeting in the United States, and as the start of the movement that fanned into North Carolina in 1801, grew up in Buffalo Church and was a member until removing to Pennsylvania in 1784. He maintained his ties with Dr. Caldwell and Buffalo Church. The first flames of the North Carolina revival were felt in August 1801 at a series of services at Crossroads Church, hosted by its pastor Rev. William Denny Paisley, assisted by Dr. Caldwell. These gatherings, in turn, gave rise to services the following October at Hawfields Church, in Alamance County, also led in part by Dr. Caldwell, which became the site of the first camp meeting in North Carolina. In January 1802, Dr. Caldwell called a meeting at Old Union Church, near Bell’s Mill on the Deep River in Randolph County, and invited his ministerial colleagues: Dr. James Hall, Rev. Joseph Dickey Kilpatrick, Rev. Lewis F. Wilson, and Dr. Samuel Eusebius McCorkle. Some 2,000 persons are said to have attended this meeting, which marked the beginning of the Great Revival in North Carolina. Religious fervor swept the state, affecting not just the Presbyterian churches but the congregations of many other Protestant denominations. A camp meeting was first held at Buffalo Church in summer 1802; while the conservative church showed reluctance to embrace physical display of religious fervor, “for twenty-five or thirty years camp meetings were held on alternate years at Buffalo and Alamance” (Buffalo, 111).

In 1868 Dr. Calvin Henderson Wiley (1819-1887), who had grown up in Alamance Presbyterian Church, was educated at Greensboro’s Caldwell Institute and the University of North Carolina, and who served as the (first) superintendent of common schools in North Carolina (1853-1865),
Before the erection of this building there was a stand or pulpit in the grove in front with seats for a large congregation; and among the most deeply impressed memories of my boyhood are the orderly camp meeting scenes of this place. The place was well adapted to such meetings; it was high and dry; there were venerable and umbrageous groves around; and the community was intelligent, sober and devoted to order and decorum. How animated, how sweet, how solemn were those scenes which now I see fresh before my mind; the vast and quiet audiences, hanging on the lips of our noblest gospel messengers; the rows of white tents, the low sounds of wrestling prayer from the deep recesses of the old forest, the still night air made vocal with the songs of Zion from many different groups; the prattle of children; the hospitable boards spread for every one who came in the name of Christ; the all-pervading spirit of brotherly kindness seen in every face and felt in every tone (Rankin, 111).
study began in 1812 at Hampden-Sydney College; he received his degree in 1817 from the College of New Jersey. Mr. Caruthers studied for the ministry at Princeton Theological Seminary. Like his predecessor, Dr. Caldwell, he, too, was licensed to preach by the New Brunswick Presbytery in 1820. For the next quarter-century, until he resigned the pastorate of Buffalo Church in 1846, he provided a learned and skilled ministry to an unusually well-educated congregation. Bethel Church, Guilford County's third (surviving) Presbyterian congregation, was organized in 1813.
Bibliography


Buffalo Presbyterian Church Session Minutes.


Guilford County Deeds, Office of the Register of Deeds, Guilford County Court House, Greensboro, North Carolina.

Guilford County Wills, Office of the Clerk of Court, Guilford County Court House, Greensboro, North Carolina.


Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery

Guilford County, North Carolina

Section number 9 Page 29


Verbal Boundary Description: The property included in this nomination comprises the two tracts in the northeast and southeast corners of the junction of Sixteenth Street with North Church Street, respectively totaling 5.03 and 1.66 acres, that constitute the site and setting of Buffalo Presbyterian Church, cemetery, and manse, and the portion of the west end of Sixteenth Street that carries between the two tracts and physically links them. The boundary of the two tracts and the street linkage is defined on the enclosed Greensboro County Tax Map #252. The property is approximately eight acres.

Boundary Justification: The property included in this nomination constitutes the site and setting of Buffalo Presbyterian Church, its cemetery, and its manse, and forms the grounds associated with the history of the church and congregation at this place, together with the portion of Sixteenth Street that links them. The two tracts owned by the church and included herein were acquired in 1768, 1827, 1850, 1860, 1958, and 1964.
United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES
CONTINUATION SHEET

Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, Guilford County, North Carolina

Section number Schedule of Photographs Page 31

Schedule of Photographs

1. Name of property: Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery

2. County and State: Guilford County, North Carolina

3. Name of photographer: Davyd Foard Hood

4. Dates of photographs: 30 June and 2 August 2000

5. Location of original negative: Division of Archives and History, Raleigh, North Carolina

List of Photographs

A. Overall view of the church (#1), looking northeast, with the path of Sixteenth Street in the foreground.

B. South façade of the church (#1), looking east from the entrance to the David Caldwell Building under the portico of the church to the Rachel Caldwell Building.

C. West side elevation of the church (#1), looking north/northeast; the center and two right bays date to 1827 while the two left bays date to the 1956 expansion.

D. Rachel Caldwell Building, and arcade linking it to the sanctuary, looking northeast.

E. Rachel Caldwell Building, Sixteenth Street façade and east side elevation, looking northwest.

F. Rachel Caldwell Building, north rear elevation, looking southwest.

G. Buffalo Church, north and west elevations, looking southeast.

H. David Caldwell Building, north rear elevation, looking south to 1920 arcade linking it to the sanctuary.

I. David Caldwell Building, and west elevation of the sanctuary, looking east/southeast.

J. David Caldwell Building, west elevation, looking east.
Buffalo Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, Guilford County, North Carolina

Section number Schedule of Photographs Page 32

K. David Caldwell Building, Sixteenth Street (south) façade, looking northwest.

L. Buffalo Church sanctuary, looking north.

M. Rachel Caldwell Building, brick fireplace in the north elevation of the dining/fellowship hall.

N. Buffalo Creek Cemetery (#2), stone wall and gate at the south edge of the cemetery, looking north into the cemetery.

O. Buffalo Church Cemetery, landscape view, looking southeast.

P. Gravestone of Mary Starrat (1775), looking west.

Q. Boxwood plantings enclosing the David Caldwell family plot, looking northwest.

R. Ledgers and box tomb of David (right) and Rachel Caldwell, looking west.

S. Landscape view of the cemetery, looking east from the east edge of the old cemetery across the 1964 addition to the Cone Family Cemetery and its iron fence.

T. Manse (#3) and garage (#4), north façade facing onto Sixteenth Street, looking south/southwest.