

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA
COUNTY OF MECKLENBURG

IN THE OFFICE OF
ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS
19 EHR 02398, 19EHR02399, 19EHR02401,
19EHR02403, 19EHR02404, 19EHR02406

<p>Duke Energy Carolinas LLC, and Duke Energy Progress LLC, Petitioners,</p> <p>v.</p> <p>State of North Carolina ex rel. North Carolina Department of Environmental Quality, Respondent.</p> <p>and</p> <p>Appalachian Voices, The Stokes County Branch of the NAACP, Mountaintrue, The Catawba Riverkeeper Foundation, The Waterkeeper Alliance, The Sierra Club, and The Roanoke River Basin Association, Respondent-Intervenors.</p>	<p>ORDER GRANTING RESPONDENT'S PARTIAL MOTION TO DISMISS</p>
--	---

THIS MATTER CAME before the Undersigned on Respondent's Partial Motion to Dismiss on July 31, 2019. All Parties submitted motion papers and had an opportunity to be heard on the record. After careful consideration of the motion papers, legal authorities cited and argued, the Undersigned hereby determines that Petitioner failed to state a claim for relief and, therefore, DISMISSES the following claims:

That DEQ erred by electing the method of closure for each of the nine coal ash impoundments subject to this litigation;

That DEQ erred in making its closure elections before Duke Energy submitted its closure plans;

That DEQ erred by using a comparative standard for its election decision rather than the yes-or-no standard set out for DEQ's review of closure plans; and

That DEQ erred in determining that closure must be fully implemented by December 31, 2029.

SO ORDERED.

This the 2nd day of August, 2019.



Selina Malherbe
Administrative Law Judge

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that, on the date shown below, the Office of Administrative Hearings sent the foregoing document to the persons named below at the addresses shown below, by electronic service as defined in 26 NCAC 03 .0501(4), or by placing a copy thereof, enclosed in a wrapper addressed to the person to be served, into the custody of the North Carolina Mail Service Center who subsequently will place the foregoing document into an official depository of the United States Postal Service:

Warren Kuhn Hicks
Bailey & Dixon, LLP
whicks@bdixon.com
Attorney for Petitioner-Intervenor

Brenda Menard
NC Attorney General's Office
bmenard@ncdoj.gov
Attorney for Respondent

Nash E. Long
Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP
nlong@huntonak.com
Attorney for Petitioner

Francisco Joseph Benzoni
North Carolina Department of Justice
fbenzoni@ncdoj.gov
Attorney for Respondent

Brent Alan Rosser
Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP
brosser@huntonak.com
Attorney for Petitioner

Taylor Hampton Crabtree
North Carolina Department of Justice
tcrabtree@ncdoj.gov
Attorney for Respondent

James P Cooney III
Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP
Office of the Attorney General
jim.cooney@wbd-us.com
Attorney for Petitioner

Amy L Bircher
North Carolina Department of Justice,
abircher@ncdoj.gov
Attorney for Respondent

Christopher W Jones
Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP
Chris.Jones@wbd-us.com
Attorney for Petitioner

Matthew William Wolfe
Parker Poe Adams & Bernstein
mattwolfe@parkerpoe.com
Attorney for Intervenor

Sarah Motley Stone
Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP
sarah.stone@wbd-us.com
Attorney for Petitioner

Amelia Y Burnette
Southern Environmental Law Center
aburnette@selcnc.org
Attorney for Intervenor

Michael Elmer Bulleri
N.C. Department of Justice
mbulleri@ncdoj.gov

Austin D Gerken
Southern Environmental Law Center
djgerken@selcnc.org

Attorney for Respondent
Leslie Ann Griffith
Southern Environmental Law Center
lgriffith@selcnc.org
Attorney for Intervenor

Frank Sharp Holleman III
Southern Environmental Law Center
fholleman@selcnc.org
Attorney for Intervenor

James Patrick Hunter
Southern Environmental Law Center
phunter@selcnc.org
Attorney for Intervenor

Megan Elizabeth Kimball
Southern Environmental Law Center
mkimball@selcnc.org
Attorney for Intervenor

Attorney for Intervenor
Nicholas Steele Torrey
Southern Environmental Law Center
ntorrey@selcnc.org
Attorney for Intervenor

Venable LLP
DHGreen@Venable.com
Attorney for Intervenor

Margaret K. Fawal Esq.
Venable LLPL
MKFawal@Venable.com
Attorney for Intervenor

This the 2nd day of August, 2019.



Cierra M. Grier
North Carolina Certified Paralegal
Office of Administrative Hearings
6714 Mail Service Center
Raleigh, NC 27699-6700
Telephone: 919-431-3000